

# **Category E: Trafficking in Persons**

# COMPENDIUM OF RESEARCH ON VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN 1993-2020



### Table of Contents

CAT	EGORY E: TRAFI	FICKING IN PERSONS	1E
	1998-WT-VX-0032	: Sex Trafficking of Women in Three Regional U.S. Cities: Links Between International and Domestic Sex Industries	
	2005-LJ-CX-0053	Assessing the Extent of Human Trafficking: A Community Outreach Approach	
		A Case Study of Human Trafficking: The Transnational Movement of Chinese Women	
		Sex Work	
	2006-IJ-CX-0010:	Prosecuting Human Trafficking Cases: Lessons Learned and Best Practices	
		Finding Victims of Human Trafficking	
		: Human Trafficking Literature Review	
		A Review and Translation of Spanish-Language Literature on Sex Trafficking	
		A National Assessment of Sex Trafficking Demand Reduction Efforts	
		Trafficking of Migrant Laborers in San Diego County: Looking for a Hidden Population	
	2009-IJ-CX-0015:	Identifying Challenges to Improve the Investigation and Prosecution of State and Local	
		Human Trafficking Cases	
	2009-IJ-CX-0045:	Identifying Community Indicators of Human Trafficking	
		: Evaluation of OVC Services for Domestic Minor Victims of Human Trafficking	
		An Analysis of Federal Human Trafficking Cases, Including the Effect of Prostitution Arrests on Trafficking Charges Filed	
	2010-LI-CX-1674·	Estimating the Unlawful Commercial Sex Economy in the United States	
		Human Trafficking Organizations and Facilitators: A Detailed Profile and Interviews With Convicted Traffickers in the United States	5
	2011-IJ-CX-0026:	Understanding the Organization, Operation and Victimization of Labor Trafficking in United States	ı the
	2011-MU-MU-006	6:Improving Trafficking Victim Identification: Evaluation and Dissemination of a Screening Tool	
	2012 ILCY 0025	Assessing the Under-Reporting of Minor Victim Sex Trafficking	
		After Rescue: Evaluation of Strategies to Stabilize and Integrate Adult Survivors of	1312
	2012-13-CA-0020.	Human Trafficking to the United States	13F
	2012_MII_CX_0023	Effective Counter-Trafficking Practices in the United States: Legislative, Legal, and	131
	2012-MO-CA-0027	Public Opinion Strategies That Work	14F
	2012_R2_CX_0028	Gangs and Sex Trafficking in the San Diego/Tijuana Border Region	
		Labor Trafficking in North Carolina: A Statewide Survey Using Multistage Sampling	
		An Empirical Analysis of the Scope and Scale of Organized Crime's Involvement in Human Trafficking in the United States	
	2014_R2_CX_0007	Prostitution and Human Trafficking: Establishing an Evidence-Based Foundation for	
	2014 112 CA 0007.	Specialized Criminal Justice Response	
	2014-R2-CX-0006:	Exploring a New Data Platform for Research on Human Trafficking Investigation,	
		Prosecution, Sentencing, Time Served, and Recidivism	17E
	2014-R2-CX-0005:	Evaluation of a Service Provision Program for Victims of Sex Trafficking	18E
		3:Advancing Human Trafficking Prevalence Estimation	19E
	2015-MU-MU-000	9:Sex Trafficking of Minors: The Impact of Legislative Reform and Judicial Decision- Making in Metropolitan and Non-Metropolitan Communities	19E
	2015-VF-GX-0064	: Failure to Appear: Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking Victims' Experience with the	
	2015 VE CV 0105	Juvenile Justice System and Their Readiness to Change	
		: Capturing Human Trafficking Victimization through Crime Reporting	
		: Researcher-Survivor Formative Evaluation of San Francisco's Anti-Human Traffickir Task Force	_
	2015-VF-GX-0108.	Bending Towards Justice: Perceptions of Justice among Human Trafficking Survivors	22E
	2016-IJ-CX-0005:	Prosecuting Trafficking in Persons Cases: An Analysis of Local Strategies and	
		Approaches	23E



2016-MU-MU-000	2:Estimating the Prevalence of Trafficking Among Homeless and Runaway Youth Age	
	14-25 in Metro Atlanta	?3E
2016-VT-BX-0001:	Measuring Outcomes in Services to Domestic Victims of Human Trafficking: Instrument	nt
	Development and Testing	?4E
2017-MU-CX-0005	: Indicators of Sex Trafficking in Online Escort Ads	?4E
2017-VT-BX-0002:	An Exploratory Study of Labor Trafficking Among U.S. Citizen Victims	?4E
2017-VF-GX-0004:	Evaluation of the Enhanced Collaborative Model to Combat Human Trafficking 2	25E
2018-75-CX-0031:	Combating Human Trafficking Using Structural Information in Online Review Sites 2	25E
2018-75-CX-0038:	An Object-Centric Approach for Image Analysis to Combat Human Trafficking	25E
2018-R2-CX-0005:	Crime in Public Space and Online Domains: Commercial Sex and Sex Trafficking in	
	Massage Businesses	?6E
2018-MU-MU-003.	3: Identify, Respond, Prevent: Addressing Human Trafficking among Juvenile Justice- of Child Welfare-Involved Youth	
2018-VT-BX-0002:	Legal Responses to Human Trafficking: Evaluability Assessments and Future Evaluati Designs	
2019-R2-CX-0042:	Advancing Visual Analytics and Computational Science to Combat Human  Trafficking	
2019-VT-BX-0036:	Evaluability Assessment of a Metropolitan Network Service Delivery Model to Connec Trafficked Persons with a Full Range of Victim Services	t
2019-R2-CX-0067:	Grooming Traffickers: Investigating the Techniques and Mechanisms for Seducing and Coercing New Traffickers	d
2019-VT-BX-0037:	Improving Identification, Prevalence Estimation, and Earlier Intervention for Victims Labor and Sex Trafficking	of
2019-VT-BX-0039:	Partnering to Enhance Services for Survivors: An Evaluability Assessment and Formative Evaluation of Safe Horizon's Anti-Trafficking Program	
2019-VT-BX-0038:	Understanding the Trafficking of Children for the Purpose of Labor in the United States	
2020-75-CX-0011:	A National Assessment of Demand Reduction Efforts, Part II: New Developments in th Primary Prevention of Sex Trafficking	e
2020-R2-CX-0022:	Disrupting Human Trafficking Networks through Mathematical Modeling: Addressing Replacement Effects and Uncertain Information	
2020-MU-MU-0040	0: Identification of Effective Strategies to Disrupt Recruitment of Victims in Human Trafficking: Qualitative Data, Systems Modeling, Survivors and Law Enforcement 3	
2020-V3-GX-0076:	Improving Outcomes for Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking Victims: A Phased Evaluatio of the LOVE146 Victim Services Program	n
2020-MU-CX-0041	Trends and New Directions in the Law Enforcement Response to the Sex Trafficking of Minors: A Nationally Representative Study	f
2020-VT-BX-0111:	Understanding the Physical and Psychological Health and Wellness Needs of Minor St. Trafficking Victims	ex



### Category E: TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS

1998-WT-VX-0032: Sex Trafficking of Women in Three Regional U.S. Cities: Links Between

**International and Domestic Sex Industries** 

Amount: \$188,677
PI: Janice Raymond
Status: Completed

The goal of the proposed project is to describe the social consequences of sex trafficking, examining patterns of violence, crime, health and other human costs; and to show that sex trafficking is a complex system dependent on international and domestic linkages. Objectives are to (1) perform a literature review to profile sex trafficking in the U.S.; (2) establish a profile of sex trafficking in three cities; (3) make connections between the international supply and domestic demand for sex trafficking; and (4) characterize local sex industries and their involvement in sex trafficking and prostitutions. Multiple sources and types of data will be collected and analyzed from victims of trafficking, victim services, refugee/migrant organizations, health services, police, immigration officers, media articles and reports from professional organizations. The project will also collect data through interviews and content analysis of police records, immigration reports and governmental and nongovernmental agency documents. Interviews will be conducted with trafficked women, immigration officials, local police, prosecutors, local service providers, and health agencies.

Product: NCJ# 187774

### Sex Trafficking of Women in the United States: International and Domestic Trends (2001) – J. Raymond, D. Hughes

Results revealed that sex businesses in each region studied were prolific and diverse. Organized businesses and crime networks were instrumental in recruiting international and United States women. Conditions facilitating recruitment of women included economic desperation and disadvantage, the lack of a sustainable income, and poverty. Trafficking patterns were diverse. Twenty percent of the international and 28% of the United States women had intimate relationships with their pimps. Methods used to control women in the sex industry included: denying freedom of movement, isolation, controlling money, threats and intimidation, drug and alcohol addictions, threatened exposure of pornographic films, and physical and sexual violence. The women suffered severe health consequences from injuries caused by violence and from diseases contracted while in the sex industry. Women found many ways to cope, resist, and survive the exploitation and violence. Findings indicate the need for prevention, victim protection, and prosecution of traffickers.

**Additional NCJ Citations: 186186** 

2005-IJ-CX-0053: Assessing the Extent of Human Trafficking: A Community Outreach Approach

Amount: \$336,177
PI: Nina Siulc
Status: Completed

The research team plans to conduct research on new methods for measuring and assessing the extent and nature of human trafficking in the United States. With its partner, the International Organization for Adolescents (IOFA), and the collaboration of nongovernmental organizations, including several member agencies of the New York City Community Response to Trafficking (NYC-CRT) project, the research team will design and conduct a multi-site field test of a new data collection instrument that will identify and gather data on individual victims of trafficking and provide critical information to law enforcement, service providers, and government officials. The research team will work with community and national advisory committees composed of practitioners, law enforcement, medical professionals, and researchers with experience working with trafficking victims and skilled in methodologies useful for working with vulnerable populations. By soliciting the input of experts in the field, the team will create a data collection instrument that serves the dual purpose of assisting service providers in identifying victims and providing researchers with data on victim demographics, migratory and employment histories, criminal networks, and the process of victim discovery. Following completion of data collection activities, iterative analysis of the resulting data



and comparison with what is currently known will enable the team to assess the prevalence of trafficking to New York City, trace the relationships between different characteristics of trafficking victims, and offer insight into trends in the nature and methods of trafficking. In addition to producing this sort of generalizable data about a large sample of victims, the results will also enable Vera Institute staff to draw conclusions about how to implement the data-collection instrument on a national scale, will point to best-practices and standardized protocols for victim-identification, including establishing consensus on definitions of trafficking and victims, and will provide a framework against which to assess investigation, prosecution, and prevention efforts mandated by new Federal human trafficking legislation.

### **Project: NCJ# 224391**

### Measuring Human Trafficking Lessons From New York City - N.A. Weiner, N. Hala

The NYCTAP focused on applied measurement. Recognizing that the field of research and practice lacked the tools to reliably identify victims of human trafficking, the NYCTAP concentrated on developing those tools, collaborating with stakeholders. The NYCTAP designed a trafficking victim screening tool to collect standardized data on victims. Lessons learned in the pilot form the basis for three sets of recommendations to (1) improve victim identification and data collection on human trafficking, (2) design a standardized trafficking victim screening tool and supporting toolkit for its administration, and (3) validate a standardized trafficking victim screening tool. The NYCTAP was undertaken to respond to the pressing need for more accurate measurements of human trafficking.

2006-IJ-CX-0008: A Case Study of Human Trafficking: The Transnational Movement of Chinese

Women for Sex Work

**Amount:** \$284,287

PIs: James Finckenauer, Ko-lin Chin

**Status:** Completed

This project sought to identify the underlying reasons, methods, characteristics, and groups involved in the illicit movement of women from China to elsewhere in Asia and the U.S. Interviews revealed that a variety of women from diverse backgrounds go overseas to engage in prostitution—older as well as younger women, well-educated as well as poorly educated, married or formerly married as well as single, etc. The study found that there is more diversity among the parties involved in prostitution than is commonly supposed, and that to portray them all in the same way as victims is an oversimplification. The interviews revealed that economic factors were the driving force behind the choices the women made. Many, as indicated, had already been the victims of circumstances. One way to view the process through which these women moved is in terms of what some criminologists call "bounded rationality." The women's decision-making was bounded (i.e., constrained or restricted) by their social, physical, and situational contexts and their perceptions of those contexts. The individual assessments of the costs, risks, and benefits involved are subjective, which is why different women in the same circumstances would make different choices and why the same women may make different choices at different times.

#### **Product: NCJ# 233583**

# Researching and Rethinking Sex Trafficking: The Movement of Chinese Women to Asia and the United States for Commercial Sex (2011) – J. Finckenauer, K. Chin

The study focuses on the economic aspects of smuggling, trafficking, and prostitution; the social adjustment and settlement patterns of the women; their victimization and exploitation by traffickers and sex industry operators; and the individual and group characteristics of traffickers and their links with gangs and organized crime. The profiles of the trafficked women interviewed revealed significant diversity in backgrounds: older as well as younger women; well-educated and poorly educated women; and married, formerly married, and single. Four in 10 of the women interviewed had engaged in prostitution in China prior to moving to another country to engage in prostitution. Economic factors were the driving force behind the women's choices. Clearly, more occupational and economic opportunity for women in China would reduce the pressure on women to engage in prostitution and sex trafficking; however, once these women had made the decision to enter into prostitution, many were then receptive to or actively sought moving abroad with the expectation they would increase their earnings from prostitution. Recognizing that these women choose to participate in commercial sex for economic reasons largely due to their backgrounds of limited options for alternative lifestyles and occupations must be part of efforts to reduce the appeal and motivational factors that fuel the sex trafficking of Chinese women. The study encompassed 10 research sites, 8 in Asia and 2 in the United States. Between December 2006 and August 2008, researchers conducted 350 face-to-face interviews with women who engage in commercial sex, sex-ring operators, government officials/law enforcement officials, and other key



informants with knowledge about the sex trafficking industry. (14 tables, 4 figures, and appended questionnaires and guidelines for interviews)

2006-IJ-CX-0010: Prosecuting Human Trafficking Cases: Lessons Learned and Best Practices

Amount: \$189,420
PI: Heather Clawson
Status: Completed

To better understand prosecutors' ability to use these to prosecute and convict traffickers while also balancing the needs of trafficked persons, the research team will examine the effects of existing anti-trafficking legislation from the perspective of the prosecution and identify critical challenges and barriers to successfully prosecuting cases. As part of this project, Caliber plans to conduct (1) a targeted survey of federal and state prosecutors in key trafficking States (n = 150), (2) in-depth interviews with key subjects from the U.S. Attorneys leading anti-trafficking task forces, attorneys in states with anti-trafficking legislation, and international prosecutors and other CJ representatives (n = 25), (3) legislation and legal case analysis, including a review of relevant State and Federal statutes, anti-trafficking legislation from countries identified by the State Department as partners (Tier 1 countries) in the fight to eradicate trafficking, and a sample of human trafficking cases ( $\beta = 75$ ), and (4) identification of best practices resulting from the three previous activities (n = 4 to 6). This study will provide key lessons learned and tested practices for prosecuting human trafficking for policymakers, prosecutors, and practitioners. This study also will provide recommendations for what is still needed by federal and state prosecutors in order for them to be effective in the fight against traffickers.

### Product: NCJ# 223972

# Prosecuting Human Trafficking Cases: Lessons Learned and Promising Practices – H.J. Clawson, N. Dutch, S. Lopez, S. Tiapula

The findings suggest that once human trafficking prosecutions have begun, guilty verdicts are likely. Just over 85 percent of the 298 cases prosecuted under the Federal Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) during the past 7 years have resulted in convictions. Prosecutors experienced in managing human-trafficking cases have collaborated with local, State, and Federal law enforcement agencies and nongovernmental organizations; assisted victims in accessing services; identified key evidence; and used proven prosecutorial techniques. Ongoing documentation, monitoring, and analysis of the prosecutions of human trafficking cases within Federal and State courts are needed so as to monitor progress. Convictions are just one measure of success. More information is needed on reduction in the prevalence of this crime and how effective work with trafficking victims is in helping them to reclaim their lives. Ten prosecutors who represented 13 offices involved in 86 percent of the 268 cases identified for the study advised other prosecutors to be patient and set low expectations, to be ready to make a significant investment of time, to be sensitive to the victims, to establish a good rapport with law enforcement, to use investigative techniques that normally would not be used, and to think proactively about what charges can be brought against the defendants. The 77 State and local prosecutors from 27 States who completed a survey noted the importance of having a collaborative and unified investigation, addressing the victims' needs, having sufficient resources, and the importance of training law enforcement officers and prosecutors to raise awareness of the problem.

2007-VT-BX-0001: Finding Victims of Human Trafficking

Amount: \$293,198
PI: Phyllis Newton
Status: Completed

This is an exploratory study of the prevalence, context, and characteristics of human trafficking cases and victims across the country. The research team will interview State and local key stakeholders (N= 240) about their experiences with human trafficking to collect information about victims, cases, and perpetrators they have encountered in their efforts to combat these activities. A primary focus of the interviews will be on identification of victims and potential victims that have not come to the attention of law enforcement. Using this information, good practices for finding trafficking victims and bringing traffickers to justice will be developed. The PIs will conduct extensive case file reviews, based on the results of the interviews, at four sites to locate cases that could have been charged as trafficking but were not. The overarching goal is to further available knowledge of human trafficking in the United States and expand understanding of how and why it occurs to enable State and local law enforcement find victims. Consistent with the solicitation, the research team proposed the following research objectives: (1) Provide a description of and document the numbers of unidentified victims of severe forms of human trafficking in the United States; (2) Interpret



the issues, opportunities, and barriers for law enforcement with victims and building cases, apprehending, and successfully prosecuting traffickers, (3) Identify the characteristics of victims and perpetrators of human trafficking, (4) Determine the relationship between unlawful commercial sex acts and victims of human trafficking, (5) Uncover likely places where human trafficking victims will be found, (6) Examine the barriers encountered by law enforcement and service delivery organizations in certifying victims and developing cases of severe forms of trafficking, including the push-and-pull factors that initiate and maintain victim's involvement in human trafficking, and (7) Code case files to determine the number of cases that represented trafficking behavior but were charged under another offense.

**Product: NCJ# 224393** 

### Finding Victims of Human Trafficking - P.J. Newton, T.M. Mulcahy, S.E. Martin

The findings suggest that law enforcement respondents in sites with State trafficking statutes were more aware of the issue and were more likely to have received training and to have implemented proactive strategies to respond to the problem. Sites with State trafficking statutes also were more likely to have collaborated and/or to be actively collaborating with Federal authorities in responding to the problem. Several recommendations for policy and practice and future research are presented and discussed. Highlights of select recommendations include: (1) expand and provide training to law enforcement and prosecutors that clearly distinguishes the various trafficking offenses, such as smuggling, domestic human trafficking, and sex trafficking; and how to identify, investigate, make cases against perpetrators and find assistance for victims; (2) develop and provide technical assistance on maintaining adequate recordkeeping systems at the local level to track and monitor sex-related cases and investigations; and (3) make resources available for law enforcement and service providers to focus on human trafficking offenses.

2007-VT-BX-K002: Human Trafficking Literature Review

Amount: \$86,802

PI: Elzbieta Gozdziack

**Status:** Completed

Investigators will conduct a comprehensive literature search on human trafficking and subsequent analysis of the rigor of the literature they uncover. To complete the literature review, the applicant will: (1) Develop criteria (appropriate for both quantitative and qualitative research) to objectively categorize and rank research-based literature on human trafficking according to its methodological merit, (2) Compile a comprehensive annotated bibliography of existing US and non-US publications (excluding media reports) on trafficking in human beings in a user-friendly and easily accessible electronic form, (3) Classify and rank bibliographic literature on trafficking in persons based on the ranking system developed in consultation with NIJ, (4) Complete a literature review based on the gathered information and reflecting the state of knowledge on human trafficking, and (5) Design a dissemination plan to provide different audiences with an easy access to the compiled annotated bibliography The products of this project will provide decision-makers with vital information to identify and protect victims and prosecute traffickers, craft effective policies, and develop efficient and culturally and linguistically appropriate programs. Those responsible for addressing human trafficking will be able to differentiate between sensational publications intended to raise awareness about trafficking, and serious literature, based on robust empirical research, intended to analyze the root causes of human trafficking; provide estimates of the number of victims; map and analyze trafficking trends and routes; examine the different types of exploitation; understand the resiliency and the suffering of trafficked victims; and assess the appropriateness of treatment modalities and psychosocial programs aimed at rehabilitating victims.

Product: NCJ# 224392

# Data and Research on Human Trafficking: Bibliography of Research-Based Literature – E.M. Gozdziak, M.N. Bump

This study reviewed more than 5,000 documents and from that created a database with 1,324 pieces of research on trafficking published in English in order to answer some basic questions about the state of research into human trafficking. Almost two-thirds of the works were journal articles and official reports. One of the questions we wanted to answer was: Who is conducting research in this area? The answer, not surprisingly, was a wide range of experts. Academics in the social sciences conducted the majority of trafficking research, with 62 percent of reports and 45 percent of journal articles. But legal scholars and criminal justice experts represented the second largest group of researchers, with 33 percent of reports and 29 percent of journal articles. This tells us that academics are not the only ones researching trafficking. Lawyers and criminal justice professionals are also contributing to our knowledge of trafficking. Another important question to ask is: What forms of trafficking are researchers focusing on? Sex trafficking was the most highly researched area of trafficking, followed by labor trafficking. Close to a third of journal



articles and 10 percent of reports, however, did not identify the form of trafficking, preferring instead to focus on trafficking in a generic way. This suggests that the research on trafficking is diverse. We can arrive at a similar conclusion when we look at the populations of trafficking victims found in the research. Journal articles tended to be more generic in terms of the population that was targeted in the research. Almost half of the journal articles used a generic term of "trafficked victims" without specifying age or gender. Reports tended to be more specific. Women and girls were discussed in two-thirds of the reports on trafficking, with boys discussed in another fifth of the reports. Again, the conclusion we can draw is that trafficking research is not focused on one specific population. The research is diverse in its approach to victims.

2008-IJ-CX-0008: A Review and Translation of Spanish-Language Literature on Sex Trafficking

**Amount:** \$59,559

PI: Sheldon X. Zhang

Status: Closed

This project seeks to fill an identified gap in the research on human trafficking. The grantee notes that while a high number of identified sex trafficking activities in North America originate from Latin America, little is known about what researchers from Latin America have written about trafficking in persons. This gap persists even though researchers in Latin America (particularly in Mexico) have been writing about the topic for some time. This project will review and make available findings from Latin American reports to the English-speaking research and practice communities, thus addressing an important body of literature produced by researchers who best know their sociocultural practices. Tasks include compiling, translating, analyzing, and providing summaries of existing literature on sex trafficking produced by researchers in Mexico and Latin American countries, grouping the literature according to the basic research orientation (i.e., empirical versus non-empirical) and developing a bibliography that will allow easier access to this body of literature.

#### Product: NCJ# 233582

#### Review of Spanish-Language Literature from Latin America on Sex Trafficking – Sheldon X. Zhang

The 72 publications found showed a steady increase in volume since 2000, peaked around 2006 and 2007, and then decreased sharply. Most of the literature was produced by nongovernment organizations (61 percent of the total). Approximately 12 percent of the literature was found in academic journals. Analysts from international or nongovernment organizations composed the largest group of authors (42 percent). Nearly two-thirds of the literature addressed the commercial sexual exploitation of children. Many authors focused on the causes of trafficking, forms of recruitment, and the modus operandi of trafficking activities. Many authors identified multiple factors as causes of sex trafficking, including poverty, gender inequality, patriarchal culture, inadequate employment opportunities, education, drug addiction, and various forms of violence. The most striking finding in the study was the few scholarly articles found. This suggests that the traditional Spanish-language academic community has paid little attention to this global problem. Possible explanations for this are offered. The literature search included all publicly available media, including computerized databases, library collections, and online postings by government and nongovernment agencies. The criteria for inclusion in the literature review were broad, including any published or unpublished papers, articles, and books. Forms of publications included ethnographies, case studies, court cases, policy analysis, surveys, field studies, and evaluations. Regarding subject parameters, any aspect of sex trafficking was included. Appended government agencies searched in Latin America, Spanish-language trafficking literature coding form and variable names, the roster of located literature on sex trafficking research, and the annotated bibliography.

2008-IJ-CX-0010: A National Assessment of Sex Trafficking Demand Reduction Efforts

Amount: \$358,285 PI: Michael Shively

Status: Closed

This research study seeks to assess criminal justice strategies and collaborative programs that have emerged over the past 20 years and that focus on reducing the demand for commercial sex. The grantee recently completed an evaluation of a model demand reduction program in which they assessed the transferability of the program model and its potential for future growth. They found that little descriptive information was available about the vast majority of demand reduction strategies, and that few evaluations or case studies had been conducted. They also found that communities attempting to address demand have done so with little guidance from the collective experience of others who have. Consequently, many programs have struggled or failed when faced with problems that had been solved elsewhere. To



inform those operating, planning, or considering implementing sex trafficking demand reduction initiatives, the grantee has proposed a systematic description and process/formative evaluation of programs and strategies employed throughout the U.S. From a sampling frame of over 435 sites that are known to have engaged in some form of sex trafficking demand reduction, they will survey a sample of 150 sites, create a typology, and conduct intensive case studies of a purposive sample of 20 of these sites.

Product: NCJ# 238796

# National Overview of Prostitution and Sex Trafficking Demand Reduction Efforts, Final Report – M. Shively, K. Kliorys, K. Wheeler, D. Hunt

To combat prostitution and human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation, criminal justice interventions and collaborative programs have emerged that focus on reducing demand for commercial sex. Prior studies have found that the use of anti-demand approaches is more widespread throughout the United States than previously thought. However, little research, or descriptive information, is available about the majority of interventions. It is also evident that communities attempting to address "demand" had usually done so with little guidance from collective experiences; consequently, some initiatives have struggled or failed when faced with challenges that have been solved elsewhere. This study, funded by the National Institute of Justice, is intended to fill those gaps. The project was designed to develop a descriptive overview of anti-demand tactics employed throughout the United States and to provide practitioners with actionable information to assist them in starting, improving, or sustaining initiatives. The study project generated several key products to share this information, primarily: this report, which summarizes the research activities and presents findings; and a Web site, DemandForum.net, designed to expand upon the overview provided in this report and to provide assistance to practitioners and others in the form of information about the range of models and program structures implemented, obstacles faced, and how they can have been overcome. In addition to these products, the authors have engaged in a number dissemination activities, such as, conference presentations and policy leader briefings. After project completion, the authors plan to continue distributing information via the Web site and submission of manuscripts for publication.

2009-IJ-CX-0011: Trafficking of Migrant Laborers in San Diego County: Looking for a Hidden

**Population** 

**Amount:** \$521,962

PI: Sheldon X. Zhang

Status: Completed

Though labor trafficking has received increased attention in recent years, there is limited research available on the prevalence of the problem. In "Looking for a Hidden Population: Trafficking of Migrant Laborers in San Diego County," researchers used recent advances in sampling methodologies to provide statistically sound estimates of the prevalence of trafficking victimization among unauthorized migrant laborers in San Diego County. Researchers also examined the types of trafficking victimization experienced by these laborers. Researchers found that labor trafficking victimization appeared to be extensive among unauthorized Spanish-speaking immigrant laborers in San Diego County. Researchers estimate that 31 percent of those surveyed were victims of labor trafficking, and 55 percent were victims of abusive labor practices or gross exploitation. Researchers then applied the victimization rate to estimates of unauthorized Mexican immigrants in San Diego County's labor market, resulting in an estimate of 38,458 victims of labor trafficking violations in San Diego County. Types of trafficking violations included: (1) threats to physical integrity, such as actual or threatened assault; (2) restriction and deprivation, such as limiting workers' physical or communicative freedom; (3) deception and lies, such as being asked by an employer to lie about one's identity; and (4) abusive labor practices, such as wage theft and workplace abandonment. Researchers also found variations in victimization across different business sectors. Specifically, agriculture had the lowest rate of victimization, whereas construction and janitorial services had the highest number of trafficking violations and labor abuses.

**Product: NCJ# 240223** 

# Looking for a Hidden Population: Trafficking of Migrant Laborers in San Diego County (2012) – Sheldon X. Zhang

Although labor trafficking has received much attention in recent years, there is limited empirical research into the depth, breadth, and scope of the problem because of the high costs and methodological challenges associated with these studies. The scarcity of reliable estimates on labor trafficking activities has long been a concern for international organizations and government agencies. Both policymakers and advocacy groups recognize that anti-trafficking campaigns cannot gain credibility without the support of empirical evidence and reliable statistics. Labor trafficking



is widespread among unauthorized Spanish-speaking migrant workers in San Diego County, with estimates that over 30 percent of this population are trafficking victims and 55 percent are victims of abusive labor practices or gross exploitation. The study results include that the following: (1) the respondent-driven sampling method can be successfully applied to studying labor trafficking activities in well-defined geographical regions with known concentrations of unauthorized immigrant populations. (2) Violations and abuses inflicted by smugglers during transportation were far less common than those inflicted by employers; 6 percent of those who traveled with smugglers experienced trafficking violations, compared with approximately 28 percent at the workplace, whereas the combined rate of victimization (violations and abusive practices) during transportation was 23 percent compared with 52 percent at the workplace. (3) There are marked variations across business sectors, with agriculture having the lowest rate and construction and janitorial services have the highest number of violations and abuses. (4) Wage and employment conditions vary tremendously from business to business; the fragmented labor market and diverse job requirements make it easy for unscrupulous employers to take advantage of unauthorized workers.

2009-IJ-CX-0015: Identifying Challenges to Improve the Investigation and Prosecution of State and

**Local Human Trafficking Cases** 

Amount: \$501,352

PIs: Jack McDevitt, Amy Farrell

Status: Completed

Researchers used a multimethod approach to examine the characteristics of human trafficking investigations and prosecutions; how those characteristics varied across different types of cases with different criminal dispositions; and how the legal environment, institutional structure and culture, and the attitudes of individual decision-makers inhibit or facilitate local prosecution of human trafficking cases. Quantitative and narrative data from closed human trafficking case records was collected to help researchers describe the characteristics of human trafficking cases that came to the attention of local law enforcement and to identify the factors that predicted different types of adjudicatory outcomes. Qualitative data from interviews with law enforcement, prosecutors, victim service representatives, and other court stakeholders involved in the investigation, support, or prosecution of the studied cases was used to help researchers understand the challenges and barriers that local communities face in identifying, investigating, and prosecuting cases of human trafficking. Additionally, descriptive information from incidents that were not classified as human trafficking but that may have contained elements of human trafficking crimes was used to understand how and why local agencies often misidentify potential cases of human trafficking. Data was collected in 12 counties across the country that represented different variations of human trafficking legislation and organizational structures (i.e., federally funded human trafficking task forces or the absence thereof) to support human trafficking identification and investigations. The study's many findings included that 69 percent of the reviewed cases went forward to prosecution but most were not charged as trafficking cases per se. Instead, they were prosecuted under older laws, such as those against promoting prostitution. Researchers found that State prosecutors are more likely to use existing laws rather than newer trafficking laws for a variety of reasons, such as a lack of precedent at the State level and the lack of specialized units for trafficking prosecutions. Additionally, many localities do not have the funds to do the travel necessary in these cases to get background information and collect evidence. This hampers investigations that span county and State lines, as is often the case with trafficking organizations. Furthermore, local prosecutors tended to regard such cases as a Federal issue.

#### Product: NCJ# 238795

### Identifying Challenges to Improve the Investigation and Prosecution of State and Local Human Trafficking Cases (2012) – Amy Farrell, J. McDevitt, R. Pfeffer, S. Fahy, C. Owens, M. Dank, W. Adams

The American public has become increasingly concerned about the problem of human trafficking. In response, Federal and State legislatures have passed laws to promote the identification of, and assistance to, victims and to support the investigation and prosecution of perpetrators. In 2000, the Federal Government passed the Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act (TVPA). The law defined a new set of crimes related to human trafficking and enhanced penalties for offenses such as slavery, peonage, and involuntary servitude. Since its passage, 49 States have enacted legislation criminalizing human trafficking. Despite the attention and resources directed at combating this crime, reports indicate that fewer cases have been identified and prosecuted than would be expected, causing speculation that the provisions of Federal and State human trafficking laws are not being enforced and that law enforcement agencies are not working together to confront the problem. Previous research has documented the challenges that State and local law enforcement face in identifying human trafficking cases but has not documented which practices would improve the ability to identify, investigate, and prosecute them. This study seeks to address these gaps. Using a



multimethod approach to examining the way local and State police, prosecutors, and courts investigate and prosecute human trafficking cases, the authors discuss challenges to the identification and investigation of these cases, and propose strategies for overcoming the barriers to investigating and prosecuting them in the United States. Findings from the analyses of multiple data sources are presented in five sections. The characteristics of closed human trafficking cases, and the relationships between case characteristics, community, and organizational-level characteristics that may affect identification, investigation, and prosecution are examined as well as the challenges that face law enforcement, prosecutors, and victim service stakeholders in State and Federal courts.

2009-IJ-CX-0045: Identifying Community Indicators of Human Trafficking

Amount: \$419,643

PI: Pamela K. Lattimore

Status: Completed

The purpose of the research is to investigate correlates of labor trafficking in an effort to identify indicators of labor trafficking that could be used by State and local law enforcement as signals that labor trafficking is taking place in their communities. The first goal is to document the characteristics and indicators of labor trafficking, including component crimes, collateral crimes, and other community impacts. The investigators plan to survey migrant workers, and conduct both focus groups and in-depth interviews with members of community agencies. Using a Rapid Appraisal Model, the objectives are: to determine the understanding of local constituencies of what labor trafficking is and identify potential indicators of trafficking; identify current circumstances or individual-level indicators and migration/transportation networks; and identify potential community indicators of trafficking, collateral crimes, and community impact using data from law enforcement and other local agencies, businesses and organizations. The second goal is to provide State and local law enforcement with actionable knowledge to help identify labor trafficking through improving their decision-making and their response to potential labor trafficking in human beings. The objective of this goal is to produce a list of potential indicators of labor trafficking by triangulating findings from the proposed multiple data collection efforts. The project will fill in the knowledge gaps about labor trafficking that may contribute to a paradigm shift in identifying victims and providing services instead of criminalizing victim activities.

#### **Product: NCJ #244204**

#### Indicators of Labor Trafficking Among North Carolina Migrant Farmworkers (2013) K. Barrick, et al.

Although law enforcement personnel interviewed insisted that farmworkers were treated well in their jurisdictions, outreach workers, who had direct contact with the workers, reported that workers were often abused and exploited. Approximately 25 percent of the farmworkers interviewed reported experiencing a situation that may constitute trafficking, and 39 percent reported other abuse. The most common type of exploitation was abusive labor practices (34 percent), followed by deception and lies (21 percent), restriction and deprivation (15 percent), and threats of physical harm (12 percent). A worker's lack of legal status was the strongest and most consistent predictor of experiencing trafficking and other violations. Workers in counties with moderate to large Hispanic populations were less likely to report any type of victimization compared to those living and working in counties with relatively small Hispanic populations. Trafficking and non-trafficking abuse were less common in counties with a high proportion of the labor force employed in agriculture. This information can be helpful to law enforcement agencies in developing training components for law enforcement officers, particularly in those areas where migrant farming is prevalent. Investigation and prosecution efforts should involve close collaboration with community-based organizations whose personnel have frequent interactions with migrant workers and their families. One of the most effective ways to reduce labor trafficking is through awareness campaigns that include flyers and billboards, particularly in areas with large immigrant populations. Data collection strategies included stakeholder interviews, a farm worker survey, and secondary community data (demographics, labor and crime). This product includes 23 exhibits, 40 references, and appended survey and interview instruments.

2009-VF-GX-0206: Evaluation of OVC Services for Domestic Minor Victims of Human Trafficking

**Amount:** \$499,992 plus FY10 supplement of \$249,998

PI: Deborah Gibbs Status: Completed

Human trafficking of domestic minor victims who are minors is an underreported and hidden problem of growing concern. Despite an increasing array of programs, services for minor victims are in their infancy and there is no established foundation of best practices. The characteristics and unique needs of minor victims of trafficking are not



completely understood, and strategies for delivery and coordination of services to these youths are not yet fully developed. To address this knowledge gap, RTI International is proposing to conduct a participatory process evaluation in collaboration with two programs funded by the Office for Victims of Crime (OVC) under a separate solicitation. The evaluation will document program implementation and ascertain promising practices to help victim service agencies and law enforcement make informed decisions about services to minors who are victims of trafficking and to build knowledge for the next generation of programs. The goals of the proposed project are threefold: (1) to document components of program implementation in two programs serving domestic minors who are victims of human trafficking; (2) to identify promising practices for service delivery programs for domestic minor victims of human trafficking; and (3) to inform delivery of current and future efforts by youth-serving agencies, law enforcement, and others serving domestic minor victims of human trafficking. The evaluation will be conducted in close collaboration with OVC-funded grantees and their partner agencies in two program sites. Throughout the participatory evaluation process, we will work as partners in the evaluation by actively seeking input, participation, and ownership-sharing among stakeholders, with the greatest investment in how the evaluation is conducted and how the findings are used.

To meet these goals, we propose a three-phase process. First, as a basis for grantee-specific evaluation plans, we will engage in a structured evaluation-planning process in which each grantee will articulate program elements and identify indicators and criteria for successful program implementation. The plan will be developed with multiple opportunities for review and refinement and buy-in by grantees. Second, we will work closely with grantees on evaluation implementation, including the collection of qualitative and quantitative data to describe client characteristics, service delivery, and partnership structure and functioning. The analysis of this data will serve as the basis for shared interpretation and identification of opportunities for program refinement throughout the implementation phase. Finally, during the dissemination phase, we will generate tailored products to four target audiences: practitioners (special topic reports), policymakers (one-page brief), researchers (conference presentations and publications), and the general public (op-ed pieces and targeted bulletins). To conduct this project, RTI has assembled a unique and highly qualified team with complementary expertise in participatory evaluation, human trafficking, and comprehensive services for high-risk youth, including wraparound models, trauma-focused interviewing and services, and intensive case management. The results of this evaluation will support OVC's mission to enhance national capacity to assist victims of crime by providing comprehensive services to minors who are trafficked and by building community capacity to respond to this issue.

#### Product: NCJ# 248578

# Evaluation of Services for Domestic Minor Victims of Human Trafficking (2014) – Deborah Gibbs, Jennifer L. Hardison Walters, Alexandra Lutnick, Shari Miller, Marianne Kluckman

The evaluation was funded by the U.S. Department of Justice (DOJ) National Institute of Justice (NIJ) with the primary goals of documenting program implementation of the three Office for Victims of Crime (OVC)-funded programs. identify promising practices for service delivery programs, and informing delivery of current and future efforts to serve victims of sex and labor trafficking of U.S. citizens and lawful permanent residents under the age of 18. Specifically, the evaluation described young people served by these programs, their service needs, the services delivered by the programs, the experiences of young people serviced and the staff of the programs, and the programs' efforts to strengthen community responses to trafficked youth. The three OVC-funded programs examined were (1) the Standing Against Global Exploitation Everywhere (SAGE) Project, located in San Francisco and serving adults and youth affected by sexual exploitation through life skills programs, advocacy, counseling, and case management for girls, including those in the juvenile justices system; (2) the Salvation Army Trafficking Outreach Program and Intervention Techniques (STOP-IT) program, located in Chicago and serving foreign trafficking victims and domestic youth engaged in the sex trade; and (3) the Streetwork Project at Safe Horizon, located in New York City and serving homeless and street-involved youth with drop-in centers, a residential program, counseling, health care, legal advocacy, and other services. The three programs collectively served 201 young people during the study period (January 2011 through June 2013). Young people served by the programs ranged in age from 12 to 18, with a median age of 17. The largest race/ethnicity group was African-American, with sizeable numbers of whites and Hispanics. Three-quarters of young people served were female, although all programs served male, female, and transgender young people.

2010-IJ-CX-1673: An Analysis of Federal Human Trafficking Cases, Including the Effect of

**Prostitution Arrests on Trafficking Charges Filed** 

Amount: \$39,087



PI: Shana Judge Status: Closed

Human trafficking for labor and sexual services is a serious crime that incurs severe personal and social costs. Anecdotal evidence and qualitative research indicate that demand for trafficking in the U.S. is associated with increases in the number of migrant workers and the use of Internet advertising services, along with the presence of a large military population and a strong local economy. Concern over a perceived growth in trafficking led the U.S. Congress to pass legislation in 2000 designed to strengthen anti-trafficking efforts, thus adding to the list of previously existing statutes under which trafficking suspects may be tried. Nevertheless, few studies exist that analyze quantitative data on trafficking, assess the impact of statutory changes, or examine the characteristics of defendants and their cases from arrest to resolution.

To address this gap in research, this study will use publicly available data, including National Archive of Criminal Justice Data on Federal criminal cases in which the lead charge involves trafficking or a related crime and on prostitution arrests reported to the FBI's Uniform Crime Reports (UCR). The study will combine these data with other publicly available data measuring factors related to the demand for trafficking. The study will also use linking files from the Federal Justice Statistics Program, which permits tracking of defendants and cases from arrest to final disposition across multiple datasets. Using these data, the study will: (1) estimate fixed-effects models to analyze the effect of factors relating to the demand for trafficking on the incidence of trafficking-related crime; (2) use the fixed-effects approach to examine the effect of the Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000 on Federal trafficking-related cases; (3) produce a summary of the characteristics of defendants charged under trafficking-related statutes and the outcome of their cases; (4) estimate multinomial logit models to predict the effect of the choice of trafficking-related statute for charging defendants on the likelihood of different outcomes in trafficking cases; and (5) estimate the incidence of prostitution arrests nationwide — using multiple imputation techniques, where feasible, to correct for missing data in counties where reporting to the UCR is incomplete — and analyze the relationship between these arrests and Federal trafficking cases.

The study is expected to produce at least one longitudinal dataset for years 1994-2008 that contains variables measuring the number of statutory charges in trafficking-related cases within each Federal judicial district, associated demand factors, and local prostitution arrests. The study will also produce at least one dataset tracking defendants in trafficking-related cases from arrest to final disposition for the same time period. In addition to interim and final reports to the National Institute of Justice, the study will produce at least two papers for publication in peer-reviewed journals. Results from these papers will be presented at academic conferences regarding policy and criminal justice issues and at conferences and meetings for lawmakers and policy practitioners.

The overarching goal of the study is to inform the efforts of policymakers and other government officials in combating human trafficking. For example, if the study can demonstrate that certain demand factors are significantly and positively associated with trafficking cases while others are not, or that prostitution and trafficking crimes are linked, anti-trafficking resources may be targeted in these areas. Furthermore, if some anti-trafficking statutory provisions appear to be more effective than others, lawmakers may consider strengthening or re-creating these provisions when debating anti-trafficking legislation.

2010-IJ-CX-1674: Estimating the Unlawful Commercial Sex Economy in the United States

**Amount:** \$449,036

PI: Meredith Dank, Ric Curtis

Status: Completed

This study focuses on the unlawful commercial sex economy (UCSE) in the U.S. It is designed to measure the size of the UCSE in the U.S. and explore the extent to which the UCSE and other commercial sex activities are related. Relying on a multimethod approach using both qualitative and quantitative analyses, the project team will collect data to estimate the size of the unlawful sex economy in the U.S and assess the ties across different types of activities in the UCSE. The study will answer the following questions: (1) How does the UCSE operate? How does the size of the UCSE compare to the unlawful drug and weapons economies? How have these economies changed over time? How does the demand for commercial sex impact the demand for sex trafficking, and to what extent are the unlawful commercial sex, drug and weapons economies interconnected? (2) What is the role of social networks in the UCSE? How do the ties between traffickers within the UCSE impact the transportation of sex trafficking victims, and what



are the network characteristics of the traffickers who operate within the UCSE? The Urban Institute will present the project's findings in two reports: (1) a technical report that is suitable for publication in peer-reviewed journals and that includes answers to the research questions guiding this study, and (2) a policymaker-focused report providing descriptive information about the UCSE.

Product: NCJ #245295

# Estimating the Size and Structure of the Underground Commercial Sex Economy in Eight Major US Cities (2014) – M. Dank et al.

The study estimates that the UCSE in the eight cities studied ranged from \$39.9 to \$290 million in 2007. In five of the cities, the size of the UCSE decreased between 2003 and 2007. There does not appear to be any connection between weapons trafficking and the UCSE in any of the eight cities; the overlap with drug trafficking varied by UCSE venue. In five of the study sites, gang involvement in sex trafficking and prostitution seems to be increasing. Pimps travel in circuits and use social networks to facilitate the transportation of employees to various locations for work. Pimps and sex workers both cited socioeconomic conditions as prominent in their becoming involved in the sex industry. Pimps use various forms of coercion and fraud in recruiting, managing and retaining control over employees. The widespread availability of the Internet has expanded the reach of the sex market for both recruitment and advertisement. Across sites, criminal justice stakeholders believed that the UCSE was much larger than they were able to investigate due to resource constraints, lack of political will, or minimal public awareness of the prevalence of UCSE crimes. Child pornography was found to be an escalating problem. For offenders (production, distribution and possession), the prevalence of online child pornography reinforces and normalizes child pornography offenses. Due to resource limitations, the least technologically sophisticated offenders are most likely to be detected. Based on study findings, 14 policy and practice implications are drawn. The study used a multi-method approach that involved both qualitative and quantitative data. The eight cities are San Diego, Seattle, Dallas, Denver, Washington, DC, Kansas City, Atlanta, and Miami. This product includes extensive tables, 155 references, and appended study material and instruments.

2011-IJ-CX-0017: Human Trafficking Organizations and Facilitators: A Detailed Profile and

**Interviews With Convicted Traffickers in the United States** 

Amount: \$488,007 PI: Michael Shively

Status: Closed

The data that have been collected on human traffickers or trafficking cases are neither systematic nor extensive enough to understand the criminal business of trafficking or to develop typologies of trafficking organizations and their facilitators. Virtually absent from the literature is information from the perspective of human traffickers themselves; this information would enable researchers and law enforcement to understand traffickers' motivations, perceptions of risk, and strategies for risk mitigation; the structure and operation of trafficking organizations; how facilitators contribute to trafficking operations; and other data that could inform more effective prevention and enforcement strategies. This project will fill these gaps and directly address two of NIJ's three stated areas of interest: (1) traffickers, trafficking organizations, and their facilitators, and (2) both labor and sex trafficking. The project team will gather quantitative and qualitative data from two key sources. First, the team will access data and pre-sentence reports held by the United States Sentencing Commission. Second, the team will conduct in-depth interviews with a purposive sample of human traffickers, the individuals best positioned to provide information about their motivations, decision-making processes, strategies, organizations, and relationships.

2011-IJ-CX-0026: Understanding the Organization, Operation and Victimization of Labor Trafficking

in the United States

Amount: \$498,844
PI: Meredith Dank
Status: Completed

The proposed project seeks to fill a knowledge gap by studying the process by which persons are victimized by traffickers to perform forced labor. Using an in-depth case study method, the researchers will analyze the stages or components of the labor victimization experience from recruitment and entrapment to transportation, documents acquisition, the victimization itself, victim efforts to seek help, and the process of victim extrication from the exploitative situation. Using data from victim service records and the victims themselves, supplemented with data from law enforcement, researchers will examine trafficking cases that fall into multiple types of labor trafficking,



including domestic servitude, restaurant and service work, commercial agriculture, factory work (sweatshops), and other affected types of work. The proposed research will provide much-needed information about the nature and characteristics of labor trafficking in the U.S., including information about how labor traffickers carry out their operations. The research will also help identify barriers that may prevent law enforcement from recognizing or acting upon cases of human trafficking that have been identified by victim service providers.

Product: NCJ# 248461

Understanding the Organization, Operation, and Victimization Process of Labor Trafficking in the United States (2014) – Colleen Owens, Meredith Dank, Justin Breaux, Isela Banuelos, Amy Farrell, Rebecca Pfeffer, Katie Bright, Ryan Heitsmith, Jack McDevitt

Data for this study came from a sample of 122 closed labor trafficking victim service records from four U.S. cities and interviews conducted with survivors, local and federal law enforcement, advocates, and service providers from each site. All of the victims in this study were immigrants working in the United States. Seventy-one percent of the sample entered the United States on a temporary visa. All victims in the sample experienced elements of force, fraud, and coercion, including document fraud, withholding documents, extortion, sexual abuse and rape, discrimination, psychological manipulation and coercion, torture, attempted murder, and violence and threats against themselves and their family members. The study also found that victims faced high rates of civil labor exploitation. These included being paid less than minimum wage, being paid less than promised, wage theft, and illegal deductions. Although legal under some visa programs and labor law, employers/traffickers also controlled housing, food, and transportation of a significant proportion of the sample. Immigration status was a powerful mechanism of control — with employers threatening both workers with visas and unauthorized workers with arrest as a means of keeping them in forced labor. Despite 71 percent of the sample arriving in the United States for work on a visa, by the time victims escaped and were connected to service providers, 69 percent were unauthorized. Investigations were not prioritized by enforcement agencies. This was consistent across all study sites and industries examined. Survivors mostly escaped on their own and lived for several months or years before being connected to a specialized service provider. Lack of awareness and outreach, coupled with the fear from being unauthorized, inhibited the identification of survivors. Policy and practice recommendations are provided to improve identification and responses to labor trafficking and guide future research on labor trafficking victimization.

Additional NCJ Citation: 248488

2011-MU-MU-0066: Improving Trafficking Victim Identification: Evaluation and Dissemination of a

**Screening Tool** 

Amount: \$448,421

PI: Laura Simich, Zhifen Cheng

Status: Closed

This observational study will validate and disseminate a screening tool with the potential to improve victim identification, victim services, and law enforcement on a nationwide scale. The study will answer three research questions: (1) Can the tool successfully identify victims of human trafficking and associated risk factors? (2) Does it work well in practice for frontline service providers? (3) If so, what is the best way to disseminate the tool? To answer these questions, this study has three overlapping parts that use quantitative and qualitative methods: tool validation, process evaluation, and knowledge translation. First, the Vera research team will lead data collection by using the screening tool and by training and supervising community-based researchers, who will administer it to a survey sample of more than 200 adult and child clients of agencies working with diverse populations. Second, Vera researchers will conduct a participatory process evaluation using focus groups with participating service providers. Finally, integrated knowledge translation, defined as dissemination planning with stakeholders throughout research, will ensure that the screening tool and user guide are disseminated to service providers and allied sectors effectively.

**Product: NCJ #246712** 

### Improving Human Trafficking Victim Identification-Validation and Dissemination of a Screening Tool (2014) – L. Simich et al.

The study achieved its validation and evaluation objectives and identified good practices in victim identification. The screening tool accurately measures several dimensions of human trafficking and is highly reliable in its prediction of victimization for both sex and labor trafficking across diverse sub-groups including those distinguished by age, gender and country of origin. The majority of the questions asked on the three domains — migration, work, and working/living conditions — were significant predictors of trafficking, after controlling for demographics. Eighty-



seven percent of the questions significantly predicted trafficking victimization in general; 71 percent were significant predictors of labor trafficking; and 81 percent were significant predictors of sex trafficking. Statistical validation determined that a short version of the instrument (16 questions) accurately predicts victimization for both sex and labor trafficking cases. Of the 180 individuals in the sample who responded to the screening questions, 53 percent (n = 96) were trafficking victims and 47 percent (n = 84) were non-trafficking victims (i.e., victims of other crimes, such as domestic violence, smuggling, prostitution or labor exploitation). Of the trafficking victims, 40 percent (n = 38) were sex trafficking victims and 60 percent (n = 58) were labor trafficking victims. In designing the instrument, the Vera Institute of Justice worked with 11 victim service providers, collected original data on more than 230 cases from interviews with potential trafficking victims, and conducted case file reviews to determine whether the screening tool could reliably identify victims. The study also conducted focus groups and 36 in-depth interviews with service providers, trafficking survivors, and law enforcement personnel, which assisted in identifying best practices in implementing the screening tool. This product includes 188 tables, 26 figures, extensive references, and appended long and short versions of the tool.

**Additional NCJ Citation: 250311** 

2012-IJ-CX-0025: Assessing the Under-Reporting of Minor Victim Sex Trafficking

Amount: \$370,000
PI: Deborah Gibbs
Status: Completed

Trafficking of minor victims for sex or labor is a problem of growing concern but not having sufficient data. This study will address the apparent underreporting of minor victim trafficking by describing the number of trafficked minors identified by two of the systems most likely to encounter them — law enforcement and child welfare — and documenting lessons learned as the child welfare system builds capacity to address minor victim needs. Researchers aim to describe the number and characteristics of trafficked minors referred to the child welfare system by law enforcement or identified among current child welfare wards; statistically assess the potential underreporting of trafficking within the child welfare system; describe the characteristics of sex- and labor-trafficked minors in terms of: demographics, prior and current involvement with child welfare and juvenile justice, referral source, and geographic factors; and describe perspectives of leaders and organizations as the systems' processes change. Data for the study consists of de-identified administrative data from the Illinois Department of Children and Family Services for all minors referred to the agency by law enforcement and other sources over 1.5 years, with a separate sample representing all wards at a single point in time as a validation sample. Data for analysis will include demographic characteristics, current and previous child welfare history, and characteristics of trafficking experiences. For minors from Cook County (Chicago) only, data on juvenile justice system history are also available for inclusion in analyses. Qualitative data will consist of key informant interviews with leaders in child welfare, law enforcement, criminal justice, and advocacy organizations. Analytic methods include logistic regression, propensity score matching and latent class models, and systematic qualitative analysis.

2012-IJ-CX-0026: After Rescue: Evaluation of Strategies to Stabilize and Integrate Adult Survivors of

**Human Trafficking to the United States** 

Amount: \$354,785

PI: Lindsay Lowell, Elzbieta Godziak

Status: Completed

This study aims to present a profile of the human trafficking survivors assisted by the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services and the Office of Refugee Resettlement Anti-Trafficking Services Programs and to evaluate the effectiveness of interventions to stabilize, rehabilitate, and integrate them into the wider society. The study will provide a better understanding of the characteristics of human trafficking victims and the efficacy of different intervention strategies in stabilizing their well-being. The victims profile will be generated by a systematic and careful use of agency data housed at the U.S. Conference of Catholic Bishops, and the evaluation of interventions will include a quantitative history analysis of the USCCB individual case trafficking data and a qualitative assessment of the intervention processes, measures, and survivor outcomes. The project will use several data sources: (1) a longitudinal, relational database of 2,233 survivor cases as reported electronically by service providers; (2) intake assessment and case notes; (3) group discussions and/or ethnographic interviews with service providers to gain an in-depth understanding of the dynamics involved in protecting survivors from repeat victimization and facilitating their reintegration into mainstream society; and (4) ethnographic interviews with and case file reviews of select adult



survivors to gain the insiders' understanding of the challenges and prospects for long-term reintegration into U.S. society. Results will include policy and programmatic recommendations vis-à-vis the efficacy of existing programs and strategies to rehabilitate, stabilize, and ultimately integrate survivors of trafficking into society.

**Product: NCJ# 249672** 

After Rescue: Evaluation of Strategies To Stabilize and Integrate Adult Survivors of Human Trafficking to the United States (2016) – Elzbieta M. Gozdziak, B. Lindsay Lowell

The examined services were funded by the Anti-Trafficking in Persons (ATIP) Program of the Office of Refugee Resettlement (ORR) under the Per Capita Reimbursement Contract administered by the U.S. Conference of Catholic Bishops (USCCB). This report is a summary of the analysis of data collected by USCCB and augmented by field research with selected programs. This study's goal was to provide a better understanding of the characteristics of trafficking survivors and the effectiveness of interventions intended to enhance their well-being. Fifty-three percent of survivors assisted under the Per Capita program were women, and 75 percent were trafficked for labor, 18 percent for sexual exploitation, and 7 percent for both. Among survivors from the Americas, 70 percent were female; however, Thailand and India both recorded over 90 percent of survivors as men. Almost half of survivors from Central America and approximately one-quarter from Europe were trafficked for sexual exploitation; the majority of African survivors were trafficked for labor exploitation. Most survivors were from Mexico, Thailand, India, and the Philippines. The majority of survivors were residing in Florida, New York, California, Mississippi, and Texas. Findings on the impact of survivor services under the Per Capita Reimbursement program indicate that it improved the measured stability of the survivors. Meeting overall client needs improved outcomes, confirming the model of case management.

2012-MU-CX-0027: Effective Counter-Trafficking Practices in the United States: Legislative, Legal, and

**Public Opinion Strategies That Work** 

Amount: \$339,001
PI: Dana Wittmer
Status: Completed

This project aims to fill gaps in our understanding of effective legislative, legal and civic anti-trafficking responses. Researchers will examine the effectiveness of State-level human trafficking legislation by coding the trafficking legislation in all 50 States, gathering data on the number of prosecutions and adjudicatory outcomes of each prosecution under these statutes, and modeling the impact of anti-trafficking statutes on State prosecutions and convictions. Researchers will also evaluate how evidentiary factors predict human trafficking prosecutions and convictions. As law enforcement and prosecutors decide whether and how to investigate trafficking cases, it is critical for them to know what types of evidence and legal tools have been most effective overall, specifically for different types of trafficking cases, defendants, and victims. To do so, researchers will create and analyze a database that catalogues the legal and extra-legal characteristics of State human trafficking prosecutions to date, allowing researchers to ascertain the legal processes that have led to successful prosecutions. Lastly, researchers will explore public opinion on human trafficking through a nationally representative survey containing embedded experiments. Because there is a very strong connection between public engagement, legislation, and implementation, it is important to understand public opinion on human trafficking and identify strategies to effectively bolster public awareness of and interest in combating human trafficking.

Product: NCJ# 249670

# Identifying Effective Counter-Trafficking Programs and Practices in the U.S.: Legislative, Legal, and Public Opinion Strategies That Work (2016) – Vanessa Bouche, Amy Farrell, Dana Wittmer

State laws that increase the fiscal and bureaucratic support for anti-trafficking enforcement have increased arrests for human trafficking. Laws that mandate data collection on human trafficking or the reporting of human trafficking have had minimal effect. Most states have criminalized human trafficking but have not increased their fiscal support or civil remedies to counter human trafficking. It is more important that state human trafficking legislation be comprehensive across all categories rather than being harsh in only one category. Requiring the National Human Trafficking Hotline number to be posted in public places is the most important provision for increasing the number of human trafficking arrests, although this has not been linked to increased prosecutions for human trafficking. The creation and support of task forces to counter human trafficking are the strongest predictors of both state prosecutions of human-trafficking suspects and suspects for other types of targeted criminal offenses. Civil provisions are less effective in predicting human trafficking arrests and prosecutions than state investment measures; safe harbor and civil actions are two civil remedies that strongly predict arrest and prosecutions. When becoming aware of the nature of human trafficking, the



public is concerned, but they see no connection between their own attitudes and behaviors and the impact of human trafficking. This analysis includes an examination of factors that have impacted the outcomes of specific cases of human trafficking.

2012-R2-CX-0028: Gangs and Sex Trafficking in the San Diego/Tijuana Border Region

Amount: \$398,824

PI: Ami C. Carpenter Status: Completed

This project aims to create a single, integrated database that lays the foundation for drawing on all possible sources of evidence of human trafficking in the San Diego County region. Researchers will combine quantitative and qualitative research methods to collect and integrate existing databases and to diversify available sources of data beyond social service agencies and law enforcement. The project focuses specifically on one of the most under-studied aspects of human trafficking: the relationship between gangs and human trafficking. This project will measure the nature and extent of gang involvement in human trafficking by gathering data from four sources: victims who are assisted by social service agencies in San Diego County, non-public law enforcement incidence and arrest records, persons identified as trafficking victims and perpetrators at San Diego middle and high schools, and the traffickers themselves. The project will also build on a year's worth of fieldwork with gang members to collect ethnographic evidence of the scope of human trafficking from the facilitators of human trafficking themselves, including a snowball sample of a minimum of 30 facilitators of human trafficking to determine the relationship between gangs and trafficking.

### Product: NCJ# 249857

### Nature and Extent of Gang Involvement in Sex Trafficking in San Diego County (2016) – Ami Carpenter, Jamie Gates

The study's three objectives were to determine (1) the scope and nature of gang involvement in sex trafficking and commercial sexual activity; (2) the scope and nature of victimization in San Diego County, California; and (3) estimates of the regional commercial sex economy. The study found that 110 gangs in the county, from a wide variety of neighborhoods and racial/ethnic backgrounds, have members who profit from sex trafficking in San Diego. On a wider scale, the study found that the scope of the underground sex economy in the county is considerably larger than the county leadership had estimated, meaning that the resources currently directed to this issue do not match the scope of the problem. Apparently, all communities in the county are impacted by this underground economy, which draws \$810 million of the county's economy. For a variety of reasons, law enforcement agencies lack sufficient information to distinguish victims of sex trafficking from other related crimes. The median age for first arrest for prostitution is 19 years old, and the average age for entry into sex trafficking is 16.1 years old. Policy implications and recommendations pertain to capacity building, service delivery, and new programming. Suggestions for future research are offered. Included are 6 tables, 4 figures, 9 references, and an appended interview protocol for facilitators and gang structure analysis.

Additional NCJ citation: 249246

2013-IJ-CX-0047: Labor Trafficking in North Carolina: A Statewide Survey Using Multistage

Amount: Sampling
Amount: \$777,476
PI: Sheldon Zhang
Status: Completed

This project will produce credible, statewide statistical estimates of the scope of labor trafficking victimization among crop farmworkers in North Carolina and investigate the types of victimization experienced by this population. This project will also compare what is learned about the scope and nature of labor trafficking victimization in the state with the nature and scope of victimization indicated in prosecuted labor trafficking cases involving North Carolina farmworkers for validation and comparison. Researchers will survey 400 subjects drawn based on a stratified multistage probability sampling of migrant dwellings across North Carolina. Specifically, researchers will use a recently developed sampling enumeration strategy that takes into consideration existing census blocks and density of crop farming activities to achieve greater precision in estimates over traditional multi-stage random sampling. Researchers will administer a survey to this sample that uses the same core trafficking measures developed through a rigorous implementation process and validated in the recent study on the scope of labor trafficking victimization among migrant laborers in San Diego County. In addition to using the survey data to produce prevalence estimates, researchers will



also provide parametric estimates of the key indicators of labor trafficking victimization among migrant crop workers and establish risk profiles of farmworkers most susceptible to trafficking violations using multivariate statistics.

Product: NCJ# 252521

Labor Trafficking in North Carolina: A Statewide Survey Using Multistage Sampling (2018) – S. Zhang, K. Barrick, B. Evans, R. Weber, J. McMichael, P. Mosquin, K. Vincent, D. Ramirez

Just over 40 migrant farmworkers were interviewed to identify potential trafficking cases and indicators that trafficking may be occurring. The study determined that about 25% of the sample had experienced some type of employment abuse; nearly 18% reported incidents that could be considered labor trafficking, and 22% reported lesser forms of labor abuse and exploitation. The most common type of abuse was a form of intimidation, threats, and fear (13%), fraud and deception (12%), and exploitative labor practices (12%). The least common type of abuse involved restrictions on physical or communicative freedom (7%). Being undocumented was the strongest predictor of labor abuse. Given an estimated annual average of 61,455 migrant farmworkers in North Carolina over the 3-year data collection period, just over 17,000 migrant farmworkers in North Carolina may have experienced some form of labor exploitation in their lifetimes, with nearly 11,000 experiencing labor trafficking and just over 13,000 experiencing other forms of abuse and exploitation. Given the link between documentation status and abuse, additional research is needed to determine whether and how temporary work visas may protect workers and whether this impact varies across states and by industry. Future research should also explore further the extent to which immigration policies and visa programs may impact experiences of labor trafficking and exploitation among migrant workers. These relationships should also be explored outside of North Carolina.

2013-R2-CX-0049: An Empirical Analysis of the Scope and Scale of Organized Crime's Involvement in

**Human Trafficking in the United States** 

Amount: \$308,694
PI: Vanessa Bouche
Status: Completed

This project seeks to gain a greater understanding of the nexus between organized crime and human trafficking. First, researchers will develop, analyze, and publish a database of cases in the United States between the years 2000 and 2012 that include human trafficking and organized crime components, primarily identifying cases through organized crime statutes and then looking for elements of human trafficking therein. The analysis of cases will include quantitative and geospatial components to determine the organized crime syndicates most engaged in this type of crime, how they operate, with whom they collaborate, common victim characteristics, other criminal activities in which they engage, and the most prevalent locations and general distributions of illicit markets for trafficked persons in the United States. Researchers will also conduct motivational interviews with a targeted subset of approximately 20 convicted organized criminals engaged in human trafficking. The interviews will provide a finer-grained understanding of the organized crime structures established around trafficking in persons, as well as provide answers to important questions regarding whether systematic differences exist in how the different organized crime syndicates traffic their victims, how these groups differ in their commission of this crime, and whether and to what degree individuals belonging to these groups could potentially be deterred from engaging in this crime.

**Product: NCJ# 250955** 

## An Empirical Analysis of the Intersection of Organized Crime and Human Trafficking in the United States (2017) – Vanessa Bouché

Searches of federally prosecuted human trafficking cases in the United States indicate that there were 862 such cases between 2000 and 2015, involving 2,096 defendants. A total of 1,227 (58%) of the defendants operated as part of an organized criminal group. Of the cases in which organized crime groups were engaged, 34% involved sex trafficking of both adults and minors; 24% were engaged only in sex trafficking of minors; 18% engaged in labor trafficking that did not involve commercial sex; and 17% engaged only in sex trafficking of adults. Regarding the national origin of trafficking victims, 55% of adult victims of sex trafficking were foreign nationals, and 92% of victims of sex trafficking were U.S. nationals; 93% of labor trafficking victims were foreign nationals. Of the organized-crime cases, 35% involved "mom and pop" operators; 33% of organized-crime cases involved crime rings; 6% of organized-crime cases involved gangs; 26% of organized-crime cases involved illegal enterprises; none of the organized-crime cases involved cartel/mafia/syndicates, but there was evidence that they facilitated the human trafficking operations of other types of organized criminal groups. Data on age, gender, country of origin, and motivations for human trafficking are



noted, along with criminal methods. Seven recommendations address the criminal justice community and other policymakers.

2014-R2-CX-0007: Prostitution and Human Trafficking: Establishing an Evidence-Based Foundation

for a Specialized Criminal Justice Response

Amount: \$440,156 PI: Rachel Swaner

Status: Closed

The past five years have seen the sudden growth of specialized diversion programs and courts in response to the intersecting problems of prostitution and human trafficking. To inform policies for these new models, a strong evidence-based foundation is needed concerning the size, characteristics, needs, and victimization experiences of the trafficked population. The study will be implemented with a minimum of 320 adults who exchange sex for money in New York City prostitution markets. To complete the proposed research project, the Center for Court Innovation will partner with the Vera Institute of Justice, whose work will involve broad consultation on planned research strategies. The study will involve interviews in community settings, using proven respondent-driven sampling (RDS) techniques, to understand the size, needs, characteristics, and victimization status of adults engaged in prostitution. In addition, the interviews will yield insight into experiences in existing human trafficking intervention courts (HTICs), since research subjects will include individuals who (1) were processed in an HTIC or (2) were processed through a nonspecialized court. The research will culminate in the use of standard quantitative analysis techniques (e.g., descriptive and correlation analysis, multivariable regressions, and interview content analysis) with transcript production and qualitative analysis of emergent themes and findings. The study will ultimately spawn an executive summary for NIJ, a series of research journal publications, and a series of policymaker/practitioner publications that identify major findings in accessible prose. Multi-media dissemination will also include posting products to websites, e-mail blasts, Twitter updates, audio interviews to announce and publicize publications, and conference presentations. Quantitative data sets will be stripped of identifiers and archived per NIJ policy.

Product: NCJRS# 251504

Navigating Force and Choice: Experiences in the New York City Sex Trade and the Criminal Justice System's Response (2017) – E. White, R. Swaner, E. Genetta, S. Hynynen Lambson, J. Johnson Dash, I. Sederbaum, A. Wolf

The study conducted in-depth, semi-structured interviews with 316 New York City adults who exchanged sex for money or other benefits. Information was obtained on their life histories, involvement in the sex trade, sex trafficking, and criminal justice involvement. The study also obtained the perspectives and policy recommendations of 28 criminal justice policymakers, practitioners, and community representatives affiliated with New York City's Human Trafficking Intervention Courts (HTICs). These courts were established in 2013 to hear the cases of defendants charged with loitering for the purposes of prostitution, prostitution, prostitution in a school zone, and unlicensed massage. The HTICs aim to mitigate the effects of involvement in the criminal justice system by linking defendants with services instead of processing them under standard adjudication and conviction procedures. Policy recommendations are presented in this report as suggested by those in the city's sex trade and HTIC policymakers, practitioners, and social service providers. The most common recommendation from the adults in the sex trade was the decriminalization of prostitution. This was echoed by those involved in HTIC operations. As interim steps, it was proposed that law enforcement officers stop arresting people for the offense of "loitering for prostitution" and that prosecutors offer immediate sealing of cases where trafficking is demonstrated and/or defendants complete their mandates. Other recommendations pertain to the "pressing needs" of prostitutes, the availability of social services, and interagency collaboration.

2014-R2-CX-0006: Exploring a New Data Platform for Research on Human Trafficking Investigation,

Prosecution, Sentencing, Time Served, and Recidivism

Amount: \$492,113
PI: Ryan Kling
Status: Open

After more than a decade of intense federal and local activity, basic information about the scope of human trafficking is scarce, and fundamental questions about the efficacy of criminal justice responses remain insufficiently answered. The proposed study will provide a new and unique platform derived from two national data collection programs



administered by Abt Associates: the Federal Justice Statistics Program (FJSP) and the National Corrections Reporting Program (NCRP). From FJSP data we will construct offender-level, linked-cycle records for human trafficking cases from investigation through prosecution, corrections, and community reentry. The NCRP gathers individual-level data from 49 state prison systems, and in conjunction with FJSP data allows us to capture recidivism of traffickers at both federal and state levels. The FJSP platform provides the study's backbone, and we will demonstrate its utility for applied research on the federal system processing of trafficking cases, as well as on sentencing patterns, conviction rates, time served, community reentry, and recidivism. To explain and interpret what we find in our examinations of the FJSP/NCRP data, we will interview 90 expert practitioners and will examine 500 pre-sentence investigation reports (PSRs) to examine the prevalence and types of human trafficking cases that result in convictions for other offenses. The study is designed to provide information of pragmatic value to practitioners, policymakers, and researchers. The separate studies of human trafficker prosecution, time served, and recidivism will be of unprecedented scope and constitute unique contributions to the field. The data platform we create for the study, and our proof of concept studies, will add an entirely new avenue of investigations of human trafficking. Its longitudinal, cumulative nature can be used for program and policy evaluation using time-series designs (e.g., difference-in-difference, regression discontinuity), and the map of the system processing of trafficking cases may point to areas of system improvement. The study's methods and results will be disseminated via peer-reviewed journal manuscripts, briefing papers delivered to NIJ, briefing papers placed in law enforcement and corrections professional organization magazines and/or websites, webinars describing the study and its implications, at least one conference presentation, and in-person briefings with federal agency leaders. The proposed team is uniquely qualified to conduct this study. We currently administer both the FJSP and NCRP, and have created programs linking individuals across datasets and years. Additionally, we have ongoing projects involving human trafficking data extractions from PSRs, and have recognized expertise in human trafficking research and in applying advanced analytic methods.

2014-R2-CX-0005: Evaluation of a Service Provision Program for Victims of Sex Trafficking

**Amount:** \$728,467

PI: Emily F. Rothman

Status: Open

The proposed research is an impact and cost-effectiveness evaluation of the My Life My Choice (MLMC) program. MLMC provides services to approximately 40 unique survivors of domestic minor sex trafficking (DMST) each year. MLMC also provides ten-session Sexual Exploitation Prevention groups to youth at risk for DMST (~400 youth per year). MLMC clients are 99% female, and 80% are youth of color. All youth in this evaluation will be 14-17 years old. This research is important because DMST is prevalent, consequential, and costly, but the U.S. lacks sufficient evidence-based, cost-effective programs to provide DMST prevention and intervention services. We will investigate whether the MLMC program is effective, and if so, what aspects of the program appear to drive the success, and the cost of providing the program per participant. We will also explore whether the program benefits some youth (such as those who are highly engaged with MLMC services) more than others. The relevance of the proposed research to human trafficking policy, practice, and theory is that it will provide new evidence about whether it is possible to prevent at-risk youth from being trafficked domestically within a year of prevention group services, and whether the theoretical basis of MLMC (i.e., resilience theory, mentorship) produces successful results for minors who have been trafficked. The cost-effectiveness data will be particularly useful for determining if it is worthwhile for the U.S. to invest in such programs. The research design will be quasi-experimental, longitudinal, and mixed methods. We will compare outcomes for those who receive both a "high dose" and a "low dose" of MLMC services. We will also compare outcomes for youth who are in the survivor advocacy services group and for youth who are in the at-risk prevention group. We will follow all youth from baseline to 12 months, with a six-month interim assessment. We will also interview a randomly selected subset of MLMC participants in order to get qualitative information about DMST experiences and service needs. The proposed impact evaluation and cost-effectiveness study is novel because, to our knowledge, MLMC is the only agency in the U.S. that is currently providing both survivor advocacy and prevention programming for DMST. A cost-effectiveness evaluation of a DMST program has never been conducted. . The research team is ideally prepared and highly qualified to carry out the proposed project, as they are experts in the conduct of research on highly sensitive topics with youth, in program evaluation, and violence-related program costeffectiveness analyses. In the first year, we will accomplish the following: (1) obtain IRB approval and privacy certificate approval; (2) hire a research assistant and complete research assistant training; (3) hold a preliminary preparatory meeting with the New Jersey and Boston sites (to prepare for participant recruitment); (4) establish a tracking system and database for cost-effectiveness analysis; (5) recruit and collect quantitative data from 180 participants (baseline), which breaks down to 165 from the secondary prevention group and 15 from the tertiary



prevention group; (6) collect six-month follow-up data from an anticipated 120-180 participants; (7) collect qualitative data from 40 participants; and (8) convene two advisory board meetings.

2015-MU-MU-0003: Advancing Human Trafficking Prevalence Estimation

Amount: \$996,870 PI: Michael Shively

Status: Closed

The proposed project will advance the estimation of human trafficking prevalence in local jurisdictions by adapting and testing our hidden population estimation (HPE) methodology by systematically and reliably sampling from populations at risk, screening for labor and sex trafficking victimization, and gathering data about prior contacts with criminal justice and social services. Similar methods have successfully estimated other hidden populations, and their adaptation and demonstration in this study will result in a methodology that is scalable, replicable, feasible, and produces scientifically sound trafficking prevalence estimates. Our key research objectives are determining the prevalence of sex and labor trafficking victimization within the arrestee and victim service caseloads in a given jurisdiction, demonstrating the extent to which local findings can be generalized, and assessing the feasibility and utility of pursuing the proposed method. The study will occur in phases over three years. Literature reviews and secondary data analyses will identify optimal candidate sites. A selection and outreach process will produce partnerships between ABT/SRBI and key collaborators in two counties in the first year. Then, jail systems and service providers will provide access and support to potential respondents, and survivors will form local advisory panels at both sites to inform development of survey instruments and administration protocols and to help interpret findings. The survey team will interview 250 respondents from jails and 450 from shelters, substance abuse, and human trafficking service providers. The sample will be divided equally by gender and screened for both sex and labor trafficking. The stock of individuals already in contact with services or in booking facilities, and the "flow" of individuals during the data collection period, will be sampled using administrative data. Asking both iail and service samples about prior contacts allows assessment of the extent of victims crossing sectors and multiple contacts with justice and service systems. Each respondent will be weighted based on their probability of selection, and case weights will reflect selection probabilities to represent all persons engaged within the collection timeframe. Knowing the size of the population observed at the places of collection, and determining the rate at which the trafficked population contacts these places of collection, we may estimate the size of the trafficked population in a jurisdiction. Study findings and implications will be disseminated to key policy, practitioner, and research audiences via journal articles, webinars, policy briefs, and presentations and a de-identified, publicly accessible database will be archived with ICPSR.

2015-MU-MU-0009: Sex Trafficking of Minors: The Impact of Legislative Reform and Judicial Decision-

Making in Metropolitan and Non-Metropolitan Communities

Amount: \$570,150
PI: Jennifer Cole
Status: Completed

There has been a growing push to pass state safe harbor laws to align governmental and community responses to the reframing of the issue of sex trafficking of minors (STM) that was ushered in with the passage of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA). Scant empirical research has been conducted to evaluate the impact of legislative responses to sex trafficking of minors. Moreover, the judiciary has been largely ignored in most of the research on STM. The proposed mixed methods project has four aims: (1) Evaluate changes in key agency personnel's awareness, knowledge, and capacity for responding to STM, including trends in charges of human trafficking offenses involving victims who are minors, from pre-implementation to post-implementation of a safe harbor law in one jurisdictional condition; (2) Examine the impact of immunity, protective, and rehabilitative provisions of a safe harbor law; (3) Provide guidance on how juvenile and family judges' knowledge and attitudes influence their responses to trafficking victims as witnesses and as defendants in crimes related to their trafficking victimization within metropolitan and nonmetropolitan communities; and (4) Identify and disseminate policy, education, and practice strategies that support informed judicial decision-making in family and juvenile court cases involving youth exploited in commercial sex. A formal partnership with a survivor, who serves as a consultant, will inform all aspects of the study to maximize the credibility, utility, and relevance of findings. Qualitative and quantitative data will be collected from multiple sources: (1) telephone-administered interviews with 375 professionals who work in agencies that serve-at risk youth and/or crime victims/offenders, including secondary data analysis of interview data collected pre-implementation of the safe



harbor law; (2) statewide secondary aggregate data on criminal charges of human trafficking and prostitution of juveniles from 2007 to 2018; and (3) face-to-face and telephone interviews with 50 family and juvenile court judges from metropolitan and non-metropolitan communities across the project state and the U.S. This study will provide recommendations for legislative reform and policy implementation based on evaluation of effectiveness of the immunity, protection, and rehabilitative elements of a state safe harbor law. Further, the identification of and dissemination of policy, education, and practice strategies that support informed judicial decision-making in cases of sex trafficking of minors will make a substantial contribution to the court system. In addition to reports and scholarly journal articles, dissemination of major findings will target diverse practitioner, policymaker, and lay audiences with multiple research-translational products.

2015-VF-GX-0064: Failure to Appear: Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking Victims' Experience with the

Juvenile Justice System and Their Readiness to Change

Amount: \$623,607
PI: Alexis Kennedy
Status: Completed

Thousands of minors are domestically sex trafficked annually in the United States. Victims' ability to successful exit trafficking is thought to depend on structural factors, including the availability of appropriate services and the support system developed post-trafficking, and minors' personal ability to separate psychologically from their traffickers' manipulation. Restoration plans that address housing, education, and physical safety often fail, as evidenced by high rates of running away or victims' resistance to assistance. Even in situations where other needs are met, a sexually exploited minor may return to a trafficking situation if psychological separation from his/her trafficker is not achieved. Very little is known about the facilitators and barriers to leaving trafficking, including victims' readiness to change. Research Design and Methods: This exploratory, sequential mixed-methods project investigates (a) actual and perceived facilitators and barriers (e.g., services, provider characteristics) that victims encounter when attempting to exit a trafficking situation, and (b) readiness to change, and other personal factors that may influence success. Following an in-depth qualitative phase, cross-sectional self-report survey data will be collected from recently trafficked young adult women (n = 240), using an audio, computer-assisted self-interviewing system. Analysis: Qualitative data will be analyzed with an inductive, open-coding approach guided by grounded theory analysis. Quantitative analysis includes structural equation modeling to assess the validity of a readiness-to-change measurement model, path analyses to assess direct and indirect effects, and multivariate analyses to describe the frequency and nature of attempts to leave sex trafficking. Subjects: Participants will be recruited from a sex trafficking survivor's resource center and from the Clark County Juvenile Justice System. About 50 formerly sex trafficked women (18-21 years old) will be interviewed for the qualitative phase. An additional 240 trafficking victims (18-21 years old) will participate in the quantitative phase. Partnerships: Researcher-practitioner partnerships were created with the Clark County Juvenile Justice System and The Embracing Project, a sex trafficking survivor's resource provider. Adult survivors of sex trafficking will play critical roles in the research design and implementation of a survey that will be used to assess readiness to change. Products, Report, and Data Archiving: Planned scholarly products include final reports, publications, presentations, and webinars. A validated readiness assessment will be one that product service providers can use as a result of this research.

2015-VF-GX-0105: Capturing Human Trafficking Victimization through Crime Reporting

Amount: \$462,973
PI: Amy Farrell
Status: Complete

Despite public attention to the problem of human trafficking, it has proven difficult to measure the problem. Improving the quality of information about human trafficking is critical to developing sound anti-trafficking policy. In support of this effort, in 2013 the FBI incorporated human trafficking offenses in the Uniform Crime Reporting (UCR) program. Despite this achievement, there are many reasons to expect the UCR program to underreport human trafficking. Law enforcement agencies struggle to identify human trafficking and to distinguish it from other crimes. Additionally, human trafficking investigations may not be accurately classified in official data sources. Finally, human trafficking presents unique challenges to summary- and incident-based crime reporting methods. For these reasons, it is important to understand how agencies identify and report human trafficking cases within the UCR program, and what part of the population of human trafficking victims in a community are represented by UCR data. We propose a study in three jurisdictions that have investigated human trafficking cases and that represent different crime-reporting structures to



answer three research questions: (1) How are human trafficking cases identified and reported by the police? (2) What sources of information about human trafficking exist outside law enforcement data? (3) What is the estimated disparity between actual instances of human trafficking and the number of human trafficking offenses reported to the UCR? Building on previous collaborations, Northeastern University and the Urban Institute propose a multi-method research design that includes (a) interviewing law enforcement, other governmental agency, and nongovernmental agency subject matter experts to understand human trafficking identification and reporting processes; (b) analyzing human trafficking records to identify how trafficking offenses come to the attention of law enforcement and get reported in departmental information systems and to the UCR program; (c) identifying indications of human trafficking in crimes classified as other offenses; and (d) gathering data from multiple systems in study communities to understand the degree of underreporting in UCR data, utilizing multiple system estimation techniques. The proposed study will provide critical information to improve law enforcement identification and reporting of human trafficking. Additionally, the proposed study will help contextualize human trafficking reporting processes to help practitioners and the public interpret human trafficking data from the UCR program. Findings from the proposed study will be disseminated through a final summary report, presentations, research briefs for law enforcement, criminal information system specialists and service providers, and scholarly and practitioner publications.

Product: NCJ# 252520

# Capturing Human Trafficking Victimization Through Crime Reporting (2018) – A. Farrell, M. Dank, M. Kafafian, S. Lockwood, R. Pfeffer, A. Hughes, K. Vincent

In order to determine how human trafficking cases are identified and reported by the police, the research team examined just over 600 human trafficking investigations and interviewed law enforcement and crime-reporting personnel at each study site. Interviews were also conducted with victim service providers and non-law enforcement agencies in each community regarding how they identify and report human trafficking victimizations. The research team determined how often human trafficking victims are identified across multiple administrative data systems in each community. Using Multiple System Estimation (MSE) procedures that compare information about identified human trafficking victims in the data systems of multiple providers in the three communities, the research team identified how often human trafficking victims are identified across multiple administrative data systems. MSE procedures were used to estimate the number of sex and labor trafficking victims in each study community. This gauged the degree to which law enforcement data on human trafficking offenses represent the population of human trafficking victims in a community. One of the 10 major findings summarized from this study is that, given the issues associated with the identification and reporting of human trafficking, it is likely that the Uniform Crime Reporting (UCR) program undercounts both the human trafficking victims who are identified by local law enforcement due to offense reporting problems and the human trafficking victims in local communities.

2015-VF-GX-0107: Researcher-Survivor Formative Evaluation of San Francisco's Anti-Human

**Trafficking Task Force** 

**Amount:** \$453,117

PI: Alexandra Lutnick

Status: Closed

In response to the National Institute of Justice (NIJ) solicitation "NIJ FY15 Research and Evaluation on Trafficking in Persons," RTI International, in cooperation with Minh Dang, MSW (a survivor of child sex trafficking), proposes to conduct a participatory formative process and outcome evaluation of the two anti-trafficking task forces in San Francisco, California: the advisory and policy-focused Mayor's Task Force on Anti-Human Trafficking and the operationally focused San Francisco Anti-Trafficking Task Force. Our researcher- and survivor-led evaluation will document essential task force elements and identify indicators and criteria for successful task force implementation and outcomes. Our formative work will result in a protocol that can be used in wide-scale process or outcome task force evaluations. It will also provide guidance to the field on how to forge researcher-survivor partnerships. To achieve this, we will (1) conduct key informant interviews with persons involved in the two anti-trafficking task forces, (2) perform secondary analysis on de-identified social service and law enforcement data compiled by task force members, and (3) create a research infrastructure that supports the intellectual and career development of trafficked persons. Key informant interviews will be conducted with critical figures on the task forces, such as government officials, law enforcement, juvenile justice, social service, child welfare, and advocacy organizations. Secondary data analyses will describe the number of trafficked persons identified by the task force agencies and the number and types of services these individuals received as well as the number of trafficking cases investigated, the number that resulted in arrests, the number of suspects charged with human trafficking-related crimes, the number of cases prosecuted, and



Amount:

the number of individuals confirmed by law enforcement to be victims of human trafficking. Principal Investigator Dr. Alexandra Lutnick (RTI) and Co-Principal Investigator Minh Dang (MD Consulting) are nationally recognized researchers with expertise in participatory research, research methods, evaluation, and training and technical assistance for agencies working with trafficked persons. In addition to the Co-Principal Investigator, survivors of trafficking will be hired as research assistants. We will also engage a community advisory board to ensure that survivors' insider knowledge helps guide the research process, inclusive of research questions, analyses and dissemination.

2015-VF-GX-0108: Bending Towards Justice: Perceptions of Justice among Human Trafficking

Survivors \$573,509 Colleen Owens

PI: Colleen Ow Status: Completed

Recent research indicates that challenges exist in the identification, investigation, and prosecution of labor and sex trafficking cases across the United States. Prosecutors traditionally define success as having secured a conviction against traffickers. Yet, research on victims' needs suggests that not all victims may best served by, nor desire, traditional criminal prosecutions. We lack recent, in-depth insight into survivors' perspectives on the legal system, and how they feel justice can serve them. The proposed research would greatly benefit our understanding of how survivors encounter the justice system by creating an outlet to learn directly from survivors about their needs for justice, their experiences with the justice system, how they should be involved in this process, and how the criminal and civil justice systems can best serve them. It will also consider whether alternate means of seeking justice, specifically through either procedural justice (justice in processes) and/or transitional justice (justice through traditional and nontraditional forms) would be successful models for seeking remedies and, ultimately, justice for the significant harm caused by human trafficking. Subjects: Experiences of human trafficking survivors with the criminal justice system. Partnerships: The Urban Institute will work with three consultants from the Legal Assistance Foundation of Chicago's Immigrants and Workers' Rights Practice Group, the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, and Harvard Medical School and School of Public Health. The Urban Institute will also work with agencies working with human trafficking survivors and an advisory group of human trafficking survivors. Research Design and Methods: The research team will work with 6-8 legal service provider organizations across the United States to collect data on survivors they have served, and they will conduct outreach to survivors to invite them to participate in the study. We will then conduct semi-structured interviews with approximately 100 survivors of labor and sex trafficking across the United States, including men, women, and transgender individuals; foreign nationals and U.S. citizens; and those who have and have not participated in criminal and/or civil proceedings. Analysis: All interviews will be transcribed and coded. Analysis will include both quantitative and qualitative techniques. Products, Reports, and Data Archiving: Project deliverables will include a final report suitable for scholarly publication; a manual for service providers; and a variety of presentations to practitioner and policymaker audiences. The Urban Institute will host an event to discuss the findings and the policy and practice implications.

Product: NCJ# 251631

Bending Towards Justice: Perceptions of Justice among Human Trafficking Survivors (2018) – J. Hussemann, C. Owens, H. Love, L. Yu, E. McCoy, A. Flynn, K. Woods

The study conducted semi-structured interviews with 80 survivors of human trafficking and 100 social services and criminal justice stakeholders in eight diverse sites in the United States. An analysis of the interviews determined that most survivors did not support traditional forms of retributive justice for their traffickers, such as incarceration. Rather, their preference for justice was to focus on preventing human trafficking. Survivors' perceptions of justice for themselves focused on receiving assistance in achieving independence and receiving resources that helped them achieve self-defined goals. Both the survivors and stakeholders interviewed expressed concern about the criminal justice system's ability to help survivors achieve their desired outcomes. Survivors who became involved in traditional criminal justice processing were less likely to indicate they felt involved in the decisions made in their cases; however, they generally felt that they were treated with respect by both service providers and some criminal justice stakeholders. Both survivors and social service providers viewed alternative forms of justice – such as procedural, restorative, and transitional justice – as structures for helping survivors achieve individualized goals. These findings provide the most comprehensive understanding to date of how human trafficking survivors and stakeholders perceive justice in cases of human trafficking. This should provide guidance for how the structure for managing such cases could be improved.



2016-IJ-CX-0005: Prosecuting Trafficking in Persons Cases: An Analysis of Local Strategies and

Approaches

Amount: \$460,000
PI: Kristina Lugo
Status: Ongoing

There has been relatively little research evaluating strategies designed to address the investigation and prosecution of TIP cases. The proposed study will identify promising state and local responses to TIP in general, and assess the effectiveness of promising strategies, approaches and tools being used to investigate and prosecute TIP cases. Phase I of the proposed study will involve surveying district attorneys across the country regarding their use of promising practices for TIP cases. The survey will provide information regarding the existence and use of various state statutes addressing TIP; data on TIP cases investigated and prosecuted; and initiatives undertaken to address TIP. Phase II will feature in-depth analysis of TIP cases in four jurisdictions: Honolulu, Miami-Dade County, San Diego, and a fourth location to be selected based on the results of the national survey. This second phase of the study will employ a mixedmethods approach. Quantitative data, collected from automated systems and case files in the four sites, will allow us to determine the number of TIP cases investigated, referred and accepted for prosecution; the number charged under state TIP statutes and the number of other charges filed; the length of time to disposition of the case; and the disposition of the case, including trial vs. plea, verdict, and length of sentence imposed. Where possible, we will also seek to measure victim outcomes such as services received and current legal status. The qualitative component of the study will consist of semi-structured interviews conducted with a variety of local stakeholders, including the DA; prosecutors of TIP cases; judges; law enforcement task force or other law enforcement personnel; and victim services representatives. Interview questions will be designed to obtain information on promising approaches and perceptions of their effectiveness; barriers to the successful prosecution of TIP cases; perceived outcomes for victims of TIP; and recommendations for improving policies and procedures for addressing TIP. The quantitative and qualitative data will be used to compare approaches across the four sites. In addition, assessments of specific local initiatives may be undertaken if deemed appropriate by the Project Advisory Group and NIJ.

2016-MU-MU-0002: Estimating the Prevalence of Trafficking Among Homeless and Runaway Youth

Age 14-25 in Metro Atlanta

Amount: \$499,905
PI: Eric R. Wright
Status: Ongoing

The 2015 Trafficking in Persons report indicates that children in the child welfare and juvenile justice system, runaway and homeless youth, and lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender (LGBT) individuals are among the most vulnerable for trafficking. More research is needed about the characteristics of vulnerable youth, their trafficking experiencesincluding both sex and labor -and how they interact with institutions to help estimate prevalence. This research builds on the 2015 Atlanta Youth Count and Needs Assessment (AYCNA), the first comprehensive, community-driven, regional effort to describe and estimate the size of the homeless and runaway youth population aged 14-25 in metro-Atlanta. The researchers estimate that approximately 3,373 homeless and runaway youth live in the immediate metro area. Of those surveyed, 49.2% reported having been sexually abused, involved in paid sex activities, and/or sex trafficked, and 20.0% indicated being involved in the informal economy in the past month, suggesting risk for labor trafficking as well. This new research project builds on the AYCNA by a) expanding the geographic focus; b) improving the measurement of the youth's sex and labor trafficking experiences and contact with law enforcement; and, c) utilizing these data to improve law enforcement and social service policies and practices and has two specific research aims: 1) estimate the prevalence of sex and labor trafficking among homeless and runaway youth in the Atlanta-metro area through capture-recapture estimation, and 2) understand the structure of the underground sex economy. In Phase 1, researchers will utilize ethnographic methods to cultivate community contacts and a working map of the social location and movement of homeless youth. Working with law enforcement and trafficking survivors, the research team will revise and expand the survey to assess a broader range of trafficking experiences and law enforcement contact. In Phase 2, field research teams will conduct systematic sweeps of the identified areas using capture-recapture methods and survey 900-1,800 unique homeless and runaway youth in metro-Atlanta. In Phase 3, the team will engage law enforcement and social service providers in a structured community conversation about the data, and will work to translate the findings into concrete recommendations regarding strategies, policies, and practices to improve the responsiveness and support services available to youth trafficking survivors in the metro-Atlanta area.



2016-VT-BX-0001: Measuring Outcomes in Services to Domestic Victims of Human Trafficking:

**Instrument Development and Testing** 

Amount: \$464,515
PI: Deborah Gibbs
Status: Ongoing

Federal agencies, service providers, and victim advocate groups have invested substantial resources in recent years in programs to serve victims of human trafficking. However, few outcome evaluations of these programs exist, and the field lacks a tested instrument for measuring outcomes. This study will help identify effective service strategies and develop evidence-based services for victims of trafficking. We will accomplish this by refining and assessing an evaluation instrument designed to document clients' progress towards proximal outcomes related to safety, well-being, social connectedness, and self-sufficiency.

To refine the existing instrument, we will conduct an environmental scan; convene expert panels of service providers, survivors, and researchers; and conduct cognitive interviews with case managers who are similar to the eventual users of the instrument. To assess and improve instrument scoring, we will engage program directors in a sorting exercise to assign the instrument's descriptors to the crisis, vulnerable, stable, growing, and thriving categories. Finally, we will assess instrument validity and reliability by having program directors and case managers use the instrument to describe hypothetical clients in narrative vignettes.

Our dissemination strategy will focus on making the instrument broadly accessible and supporting its use within outcome evaluations of trafficking victim service programs. Our anticipated products and dissemination strategy will focus on three audiences: (1) service providers who can use the instrument within their programs, (2) funders and policymakers who can support increased outcome evaluation within trafficking programs and incorporate findings into future program development, and (3) researchers and evaluators who assist service providers in collecting and using outcome data.

2017-MU-CX-0005: Indicators of Sex Trafficking in Online Escort Ads

Amount: \$597,532
PI: Kristina Lugo
Status: Ongoing

The goal of this project is to improve sex victim identification and investigations. To accomplish this, the applicant plans to (1) investigate whether there are indicators that differentiate online escort ads related to sex trafficking with non-trafficking sex work ads and (2) determine which specific indicators, or combination of indicators, are most likely to predict whether the ad represents a case of sex trafficking, broken down by age (minor vs. adult), region, and type of sex trafficking. Recommendations will be made as to how and when escort ads are most useful in identifying trafficking cases, and which indicators or combination of indicators are most likely to identify a case of human trafficking if present in an ad. Tested indicators will be determined by previous research and focus groups' results (law enforcement, victim advocates, trafficking survivors, and non-trafficked sex workers). Research will be conducted through case data on closed cases involving escort ads. The ultimate goal of this research is to create a practical guide for police and prosecutors that uses escort ads as evidence to refer to in analyzing these advertisements more efficiently, and as a basis for jury instructions regarding ads as evidence during prosecution of internet-facilitated sex trafficking cases.

2017-VT-BX-0002: An Exploratory Study of Labor Trafficking Among U.S. Citizen Victims

Amount: \$873,508
PI: Meredith Dank
Status: Ongoing

The project aims to answer three main questions: (1) What personal or structural vulnerabilities put U.S. citizens at risk for labor trafficking? (2) Where does labor trafficking experience fall on a continuum of labor exploitation for U.S. citizen workers? (3) How do U.S. citizens experience labor trafficking victimization? These questions will be answered through a survey of individuals who are at high risk for victimization in three U.S. sites (NYC, San Diego, Anchorage) as well as one-on-one interviews with a subsample of these victims. The samples will be derived from snowball sampling techniques and collaboration with social service providers.



2017-VF-GX-0004: Evaluation of the Enhanced Collaborative Model to Combat Human Trafficking

**Amount:** \$679,988

PI: William Adams & Jeanette Hussemann

Status: Ongoing

Both the Office for Victims of Crime (OVC) and the Bureau of Justice Assistance (BJA) provide funding for the Enhanced Collaborative Model (ECM); the ECM includes task forces responsible for identifying and assisting victims of sex and labor trafficking, and investigating and prosecuting of human trafficking cases in the communities that they serve. The study will examine differences across task forces in terms of their size, scope, organization, leadership structure, specialized investigative units, and other characteristics to determine which features contribute to task force effectiveness and lead to successful outcomes. The goals of this project include employing a multi-method approach to assess the impact of the ECM in identifying and assisting human trafficking victims, and investigating and prosecuting those crimes; the second goal of the project is to analyze differences in various task force implementation models to understand which model and which particular features contribute to the most successful outcomes. There are three main research questions that will guide this study: (1) What is the impact of the ECM on addressing human trafficking (in terms of sex and labor trafficking victims identified and assisted, and cases investigated and prosecuted)? (2) What types of ECMs perform well and why, and which elements are associated with effective and well-functioning task forces? and (3) What characteristics of human trafficking predict successful case outcomes?

2018-75-CX-0031: Combating Human Trafficking Using Structural Information in Online Review

Sites

Amount: \$361,069
PI: Erica Briscoe
Status: Ongoing

The applicant proposes to develop a prototype tool that will better identify cases of likely victims of human trafficking and those who victimize them by using machine learning and social network analysis. The project will result in a significant new capability for law enforcement. The project specifically focuses on detecting and differentiating child and adult victims. The resulting prototype will allow law enforcement to search and prioritize (1) trafficking cases by victim and (2) trafficking by specific johns. GTARC and the Georgia Tech College of Computing are partnering with the DeKalb County Police Department (DKPD). The DKPD has expressed its willingness to participate in data annotation and prototype development activities, including user testing. Data will be collected from online review websites and then annotated for a variety of phenomena, including keywords associated with trafficking cases for adults and for children. Machine learning models will be trained using a ground truth data set based on online reviews recovered and processed using these keywords. The resulting models will then be trained and optimized to detect and classify online reviews according to criteria such as trafficking, adult, and child. To enable law enforcement access to the prototype software, GTARC will create a secure public-facing website that will run a copy of the prototype. The web application will require that users login with a username and password. GTARC will rely on a snowball-style user identification process where existing users of the system may opt to send links to individuals they deem credible as additional users who should have access to the system. The initial set of users will be DKPD. At the request of the government, GTARC will make accounts available to any individuals and groups of users the government recommends. Training materials offered in a short course format will also be available.

2018-75-CX-0038: An Object-Centric Approach for Image Analysis to Combat Human Trafficking

Amount: \$1,005,852
PI: Robert Pless
Status: Ongoing

Images are often part of a criminal investigation, but for questions like "where was this image taken," investigators are often limited to using generic tools designed for different purposes, like Google reverse-image search. This project, developed with feedback from the St. Louis County (Missouri) Police Department and the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (NCMEC), aims to develop novel approaches to index and search imagery, and to deploy these in a prototype search tool with a focus on fighting human trafficking. This tool will be an enhanced version of the TraffickCam system that GWU is already developing for law enforcement. TraffickCam consists of a large database of hotel room photographs and an Artificial Intelligence-based platform for law enforcement to compare



victim photographs to the photographs in that database in order to determine the hotel where a victim was photographed. The database of hotel room photographs contains several million hotel room images collected from both publicly available travel websites (e.g., Expedia, TripAdvisor) and the over 100,000 users of our mobile application, which allows travelers to submit images of hotel rooms they visit. TraffickCam uses neural networks to support image-based search for members of law enforcement. Images containing victims of trafficking in hotel rooms are provided as input, and the system returns the hotels with the most similar images. (TraffickCam is currently being used and tested by NCMEC and the St. Louis County Police Department.) This research seeks to address user input on ways that the tool could better align with their investigative approaches, including searches with a smaller part of the victim photograph, such as just a particular object that seems unique; more easily understood explanations of why the AI system returned a specific result; and the ability to determine where a victim was photographed even if the hotel has been renovated since the photograph was captured. Implementing these desired capabilities is non-trivial. In this proposal, GWU addresses the research questions necessary to provide a more useful AI-based investigative tool to law enforcement officers. Specifically, GWU considers the following questions: What is the best image representation to support exploratory investigative search? How can black box AI tools demonstrate why two images or two objects match? How can learning-based approaches adapt to differences between the query and the database imagery, and detect and model changes in the database over time? GWU's approach will be to improve current Deep Learning computational models to more explicitly focus on and visualize objects in the images. This will support flexible, intuitive ways for investigators to recognize where images were taken, what objects are recognizable within images, and what sets of images have the same object. The version of TraffickCam resulting from this project will be provided to the NIJ Testing and Evaluation Center to assess technical performance, conduct operation assessment of the technology, or conduct an impact assessment for the technology.

2018-R2-CX-0005: Crime in Public Space and Online Domains: Commercial Sex and Sex Trafficking

in Massage Businesses

Amount: \$32,000
PI: Ieke De Vries
Status: Ongoing

The goal of this project is to identify investigative practices for commercial sex trafficking. The study proposes to analyze online and administrative data on approximately 3,000 massage businesses to be linked to information about the users who frequent the establishments, and the social and physical context where the establishments are located. Indicators of sex trafficking, drawn from human trafficking investigations and qualitative interviews with practitioners, will be used to determine which types of commercial sex operations are likely to engage in sex trafficking. The study focuses on Massachusetts, Texas, and Washington, three states where criminal justice agencies are taking proactive steps to identify and disrupt illicit massage businesses. The core analytical strategies include (1) automated text analyses to identify commercial sex and sex trafficking in client-based web reviews and forum posts; (2) multi-level modeling to understand the contextual predictors of commercial sex and sex trafficking; and (3) network analysis to identify how online clientele networks drive these problems.

2018-MU-MU-0033: Identify, Respond, Prevent: Addressing Human Trafficking among Juvenile Justice-

and Child Welfare-Involved Youth

Amount: \$689,381
PI: Deborah Gibbs
Status: Ongoing

This study will expand on previous data analyses conducted by a NIJ-funded project examining human trafficking allegations investigated by the Florida child welfare agency. This project will use matched juvenile justice and child welfare data lifetime records for all youth born between 1996 and 2002 who were served by either system in Florida, to build lifetime histories for a 7-year birth cohort of youth involved in either or both systems. The resulting analytic data set will include more than 6,000 human trafficking allegations involving more than 4,500 youth. This study will extend our understanding of human trafficking by analyzing the lifetime trajectories of system-involved youth — examining relationships among trafficking victimization, youth characteristics, and experiences in the juvenile justice and child welfare systems. Analyses will address the following specific study goals: (1) to inform identification of trafficking by assessing the predictive utility of Florida's Human Trafficking Screening Tool using ordered multinomial regressions and factor analysis; (2) to inform practitioners' responses to trafficked youth by describing characteristics of those who experience trafficking during juvenile justice or child welfare supervision — or who enter juvenile justice supervision with prior human trafficking allegations — using descriptive statistics and linear and



logistic regression; and (3) to inform secondary prevention for at-risk youth by identifying those at greatest risk throughout adolescence, and inform tertiary prevention among trafficked youth by identifying those at greatest risk of subsequent victimization following an initial trafficking allegation, using grow mixture models. Inferential models will be cross-validated using a random 50% sample of cases and will incorporate an estimate of trafficking underidentification into growth mixture models. Study findings will be shared through multiple channels with practitioners and policymakers via summary reports, briefs, and webinars.

2018-VT-BX-0002: Legal Responses to Human Trafficking: Evaluability Assessments and Future

**Evaluation Designs** 

Amount: \$428,073
PI: Elise White Status: Ongoing

The Center for Court Innovation (CCI) and RTI International plan to conduct evaluability assessments of legal responses to human trafficking at key decision-making points along the criminal justice system continuum, including police- and prosecutor-led diversion programs and courts that are specifically designed to address sex trafficking. The applicant has partnered with the following sites that have established innovative legal approaches to addressing the needs of trafficking victim-defendants: Queens Human Trafficking Intervention Court (HTIC) in Queens, NY; Changing Actions to Change Habits (CATCH) Court in Columbus, OH; Davidson County Courts Grace Empowered and Cherished HEARTS program in Nashville, TN; King County Law Enforcement Assisted Diversion (LEAD) Program in Seattle, WA; and Project 180 in Houston, TX. Using a mix of research methods and data sources, the study will collect and document detailed information about each program model, including goals and objectives, strategies and activities, implementation, and data systems and sources. This work will result in the development of several products describing each program model, including a logic model and performance indicators to measure the program's outputs and short- and long-term outcomes. Study activities will culminate with systematic evaluability assessments, and process and impact evaluation designs for each program model. The results from this foundational research study will serve as an invaluable first step toward understanding any future impact by assessing the effectiveness of these or similar trafficking focused diversion programs.

2019-R2-CX-0042: Advancing Visual Analytics and Computational Science to Combat Human

**Trafficking** 

**Amount:** \$86,428

PI: Julia Deeb-Swihart

Status: Closed

Human Trafficking of children is a serious crime that continues to plague the United States. With the rise of computing technologies, the internet has become one of the main mediums through which this crime is facilitated. Fortunately, these online activities leave traces which are invaluable to law enforcement agencies trying to stop human trafficking. However, identifying and intervening with these cases is still a challenging task. The sheer volume of online activity makes it difficult for law enforcement to efficiently identify any potential leads. To compound this issue, traffickers are constantly changing their techniques online to evade detection. Thus, there is a need for tools to efficiently sift through all this online data and narrow down the number of potential leads that a law enforcement agency can deal with. While some tools and prior research do exist for this purpose, few of these tools target review sites (sometimes referred to as "john boards"), and most tools focus solely on the victims, ignoring the traffickers and customers who facilitate the trafficking. Additionally, none of these tools adequately address law enforcement user needs for information visualizations. The purpose of this project is therefore to build a prototype for a tool that assists law enforcement with identifying potential victims and those who exploit them. In particular, this work will create models to assist with identifying victims from online sites using machine learning and use social network analysis to uncover the customers who exploit those children. The researcher will then create a functional prototype that incorporates these models into a visual analytics system. This work is informed by an initial interview study with law enforcement officials and an initial research prototype.

2019-VT-BX-0036: Evaluability Assessment of a Metropolitan Network Service Delivery Model to

Connect Trafficked Persons with a Full Range of Victim Services



Amount: \$294,221
PI: Roy Ahn
Status: Open

The goal of this study is to conduct a formative evaluation and evaluability assessment of a novel victim service delivery network model for trafficked survivors in the Greater Buffalo area. Toward this goal, NORC is partnering with the International Institute of Buffalo, a local and regional leader of enhanced comprehensive services for trafficked survivors, and the Buffalo City Court, an established trauma-informed Human Trafficking Intervention Court (HTIC), which itself collaborates with over two dozen local social service agencies.

This study will be the first to assess an integrated municipal network model inclusive of the role of a trauma-informed HTIC collaborating to meet survivors' needs. As components of this formative research project, the research team will prepare a thorough description of the Greater Buffalo network service delivery model inclusive of a program logic model; an implementation guide for the Great Buffalo network approach to meeting the needs of trafficking survivors; assessment of data sources and access to data to inform evaluation network analyses at the individual and agency levels; and access to survivors for interviews regarding victim service acquisition and helpfulness. To gain this information, NORC will develop data collection tools and templates, consent procedures, interview guides, outcome measures, and an estimate of the burden on participants to conduct an outcome evaluation.

This two-year project will answer questions about multi-agency victim service delivery models that are presently unanswered, such as: 1) What is the structure of a municipal and regional network of victim service providers interacting with the criminal justice system to meet the needs of individuals who have been trafficked or are at high risk of trafficking?; 2) Is there a replicable implementation plan of this partnership network of victim service programs that can be documented for replication in other municipalities?

The applicant hypothesizes that a replicable victim service delivery network model can be explicated through a program logic model and implementation guide, and that agencies participating in this service delivery model will be supportive of a subsequent outcome evaluation of the collaborative Greater Buffalo network. The research team will prepare a report of results for dissemination to practitioners in the field of victim services, for consideration by jurisdictions seeking to establish or improve the effective outcomes of local trauma-informed HTICs, and for NIJ consideration as the basis for the design and implementation of a full-scale outcome evaluation of this novel metropolitan network service delivery model.

2019-R2-CX-0067: Grooming Traffickers: Investigating the Techniques and Mechanisms for Seducing

and Coercing New Traffickers

**Amount:** \$499,796

PI: Amber Horning-Ruf

Status: Open

This proposal will investigate how sex traffickers are groomed, or mentored, to be traffickers, how they groom new traffickers, and how they are socially networked. Past research indicates how traffickers groom trafficking victims, but few have examined how people learn techniques of deception, manipulation, and coercion, and move through the illicit sex trade to become traffickers. This project will examine the nature and process of grooming of new sex traffickers and recruiters, especially identifying variations within social networks of conventional and illicit groups. The applicant aims to investigate three research questions:

- 1) Are there patterned processes or mechanisms from which older/experienced traffickers teach or model these skills to the pimps, recruiters, sex workers or sex trafficking victims who, over time, recruit other trafficking victims?
- 2) How are traffickers socially networked to other traffickers, pimps and established sex workers who manage or recruit other sex workers (i.e., "bottoms") and how does grooming differ across social networks in New York City and Chicago?



3) How do traffickers detect vulnerabilities of potential recruits and what are the key individual and structural vulnerabilities that they target?

Recruiting through multiple entry points and financial incentives, the applicant will conduct in-depth interviews with a total of 200 traffickers, "bottoms" or recruiters/assistant managers who are active in the illicit sex trade in New York City and Chicago. These data will reveal strategies about how to identify and prevent traffickers' grooming, providing critical knowledge for anti-trafficking agencies and law enforcement.

2019-VT-BX-0037: Improving Identification, Prevalence Estimation, and Earlier Intervention for

Victims of Labor and Sex Trafficking

Amount: \$499,483
PI: Ryan Shields
Status: Open

The proposed study will leverage past work on measuring human trafficking and apply proven methods in novel ways to advance the methodology for trafficking prevalence estimation. The proposed project uses a mixed-methods approach to study the prevalence of trafficking victimization, using the hidden prevalence estimation (HPE) method. The HPE method uses administrative data from institutions where victims intersect with jail systems and providers of social services (e.g., homeless shelters, jail booking facilities, hospital emergency departments) to sample individuals. The proposed total sample size is 700 subjects. The estimation method relies on calculating the probability that people within the county will appear at the places of collection, allowing the applicant to model the size of the entire population relative to the size of the general population. The project team will partner with several agencies in a single state. The project team will also partner with a local organization (e.g., university, survey firm) to assist in survey data collection. Given that these findings will be particularly relevant for both practitioners and policymakers, the applicant will develop policy briefs and presentations for targeted audiences, such as investigators, prosecutors, healthcare and social service providers, legislators, and managers of local, state, and federal agencies.

2019-VT-BX-0039: Partnering to Enhance Services for Survivors: An Evaluability Assessment and

Formative Evaluation of Safe Horizon's Anti-Trafficking Program

Amount: \$390,522

PI: Amanda Stylianou

Status: Open

Researchers from the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill (UNC-CH) will partner with an experienced evaluation group from Safe Horizon (SH), one of the nation's largest victim services providers, to conduct an evaluability assessment and formative evaluation of SH's Anti-Trafficking Program (SH-ATP). The proposed study will address the lack of empirical evidence about anti-trafficking services and provide guidance concerning how to evaluate such services meaningfully. SH-ATP provides comprehensive case management – including social work and legal services - to both sex and labor trafficking victims. SH and UNC-CH will partner to conduct an evaluability assessment by reviewing extant program documents, holding site visits, conducting qualitative data collection with program stakeholders (N=40), and quantitative descriptive analyses of recent program data (N=500). This evaluability assessment will produce program materials (i.e., theory of change, logic model, implementation guide, fidelity instruments) and research materials (i.e., participant recruitment, outcomes, data collection protocols). Building from the evaluability assessment, our team will also conduct a formative evaluation of SH-ATP to inform a future, rigorous intervention study. The formative study will include a process evaluation with program data from SH-ATP participants (N=65), and a preliminary longitudinal outcome evaluation to assess effectiveness with survivor participants (N=30). An Advisory Group of expert survivor consultants, researchers, and expert practitioners will be engaged to provide feedback on all project activities, materials, and findings. This project will develop evidence and products to guide services for, and responses towards, strengthening anti-trafficking initiatives across the United States.

2019-VT-BX-0038: Understanding the Trafficking of Children for the Purpose of Labor in the United

States

Amount: \$664,690
PI: Amy Farrell
Status: Open



The proposed multi-method project seeks to answer three questions to enhance the understanding of child labor trafficking in the US.

- 1. What is the nature of child labor trafficking in the US and how is it distinct from other forms of labor abuse involving children?
- 2. Who are the perpetrators of child trafficking crimes (e.g., individuals, organized syndicates, families, etc.) and how do they operate?
- 3. How are cases of labor trafficking involving minors being identified and what are the challenges facing childserving agencies, including child protection and law enforcement, in identifying and responding to these cases?

Data will be collected in four US sites where multiple child labor trafficking cases have been identified. The research team will sample client records from providers who serve child labor trafficking victims in each site. Information will be coded from these records to identify demographic information about child labor trafficking victims, information about recruitment, exploitation, and perpetrators. The applicant will interview law enforcement and child services stakeholders in each of the sites to gain a better understanding from them about challenges in identifying this population. The applicant will analyze and identify differences between US citizen and foreign national child labor trafficking victims. Interviews with victim service and legal providers will supplement the information in the case records regarding child labor trafficking victimization. Additionally, the interviews will assist in gaining a broader picture of the nature of child labor trafficking victimization and the experiences of victims in the local area. Finally, working with providers in each of the four study sites, the applicant will interview survivors who will provide insights into the key service needs of this population, how this population may come into contact with child welfare agencies and justice systems, and the degree to which existing services can assist these child victims.

2020-75-CX-0011: A National Assessment of Demand Reduction Efforts, Part II: New Developments in

the Primary Prevention of Sex Trafficking

Amount: \$239,946 PI: Michael Shively

Status: Open

The applicant's proposed study is designed to fill current gaps in knowledge about sex trafficking demand reduction efforts through nationwide, systematic data collection and assessment. The proposed study builds directly upon previous research supported by NIJ that produced information widely used throughout the United States about tactics used to prevent sex trafficking by attacking consumer-level demand. The previous study was the "National Assessment of Demand Reduction Efforts" funded in 2008 and completed in 2012. That projected funded the development of The Demand Forum Website. The Website provides overviews of each tactic (i.e., John school, reverse stings, shaming, and vehicle seizures) and summary pages for every jurisdiction in which they have been implemented. Since the website was launched in 2013, it has been used by law enforcement agencies, community collaborations, and state and federal legislatures, and the number of cities and counties known to use these tactics has grown from 900 to more than 2,100. The applicant proposes to update and expand on this previous work (e.g., National Assessment/Demand Forum) using a mixed methods approach. They propose to systematically gather information about current tactics, expand the demand reduction typology to include innovations, collect detailed information about new technology and its applications to demand reduction efforts, and update content regarding established tactics. Data collection will involve web searches, a survey of law enforcement agency representatives from more than 2,150 U.S. cities and counties, and three county-level case studies involving site visits. The key deliverable of the study will be a new "2.0" version of the Demand Forum Website. Another product of the proposed study will be a brief, easily understood overview of different types of technology and how they may be deployed autonomously or integrated into law enforcement operations.

2020-R2-CX-0022: Disrupting Human Trafficking Networks through Mathematical Modeling:

**Addressing Replacement Effects and Uncertain Information** 

Amount: \$100,000

PI: Daniel Kosmas, Thomas Sharkey

Status: Open



Human trafficking affects millions of people, a majority of whom have yet to be identified, and generates millions in illicit profits. Despite a growing awareness of the magnitude of the problem, there is a lack of quantitative methodology to assist policymaking in combating human trafficking. Two of the challenges of applying quantitative methodology to disrupting human trafficking networks are a lack of data on human trafficking networks and limited work in modeling how human trafficking networks operate. The purpose of this project is to develop novel prescriptive analytics to assist criminal justice practitioners in the decision-making process in disrupting human trafficking networks, as well as develop a network generator that will simulate human trafficking networks. The generator will be developed from quantitative network data based on qualitative data collected by a team of social science researchers at the University of Minnesota. The team has interviewed trafficking survivors and those that are involved in organizations supporting survivors to understand the operations of different types of trafficking operations. In addition, the team has reviewed law enforcement case files (both those available in the public record and investigator notes) on several trafficking operations in the state of Minnesota. These analytics will be based on network interdiction problems, a class of mathematical problems that have been successfully applied to the disruption of nuclear smuggling and drug trafficking networks. Current limitations on applying network interdiction problems to disrupting human trafficking is the uncertainty in the network structure and that traffickers will react to any disruption efforts to mitigate their losses. The researchers plan to expand upon decomposition algorithms, the current solution methodology to these problems, in three stages. They will first work to solve network interdiction problems with incomplete information and network restructuring. They then will work to solve multi-period network interdiction problems with network restructuring. The project will conclude with solving multi-period network interdiction problems with incomplete information and network restructuring. These analytics will be validated, with the assistance of the team of social scientists at the University of Minnesota, on networks produced by the network generator. The network generator and analytics will be made publicly available. With the assistance of these tools, criminal justice practitioners will be able to better allocate resources in the efforts to combat human trafficking, reducing costs associated with combatting human trafficking and allowing them to assist more survivors of human trafficking.

2020-MU-MU-0040: Identification of Effective Strategies to Disrupt Recruitment of Victims in Human

Trafficking: Qualitative Data, Systems Modeling, Survivors and Law Enforcement

Amount: \$758,811 PI: Lauren Martin

Status: Open

Sex trafficking operations rely on recruiting and retaining potential victims. More research is needed on recruitment, specifically networks, flows of people, goods and money, and cascading impacts of interventions on the operation, victims, the marketplace, and society. The proposed study will build on a previously funded National Science Foundation study. They will gather data in Minnesota from (1) detailed sex trafficking investigation case file reviews (N=8 networks including single pimp, pimp networks, large family-based operations, massage parlors, and brothel types) expected to be more than 8,000 pages; and (2) key informant interviews with law enforcement, service providers and survivors (N=50). This mixed-methods study combines qualitative research, operations research, and a community-based participatory approach to develop mathematical models that will inform criminal justice related decision-making in the field. The design includes: (1) qualitative data collection, (2) transformation of data into a data file of node/arc relationships and characteristics, (3) mathematical modelling using the data file, and (4) outputs of visualization of recruitment networks and dynamics of interventions and disruptions. This project has the potential to contribute to the field's ability to inform practitioners where interventions can be used not only to interrupt recruitment strategies in one portion of a network, but the innovative methods may reduce the likelihood of victim replacement and ultimately reduce the number of victims of trafficking overall.

2020-V3-GX-0076: Improving Outcomes for Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking Victims: A Phased

**Evaluation of the LOVE146 Victim Services Program** 

Amount: \$455,598
PI: Lisa Jones
Status: Open

The goal of this study is to conduct a formative evaluation and evaluability assessment of the survivor care programs developed by LOVE146 for domestic minor sex trafficking (DMST) victims in Connecticut. Researchers, with the support of the program and an advisory board, will develop program logic models, implementation guides and fidelity



measurement tools, and will analyze five years of program data to document service delivery profiles. Additionally, the project will address a key evaluation barrier: feasible research protocols for involving this vulnerable population. In Year 2 of the study, the team will pilot the developed protocols and measures using online surveys of a sample of survivors (N=25).

2020-MU-CX-0041: Trends and New Directions in the Law Enforcement Response to the Sex

Trafficking of Minors: A Nationally Representative Study

Amount: \$991,015

PI: Kimberly Mitchell

Status: Open

This study proposes to replicate an earlier national study on police investigations of child sex trafficking (CST). The previous study was conducted in 2005 and called the National Juvenile Prostitution Study (N-JPS). The applicants plan to conduct this study using multiple data collection methods. First, they will survey a nationally representative sample of approximately 3,000 law enforcement agencies (LEAs) by mail asking about the number of CST cases with arrests, detentions or alternatives to arrest in 2019. To develop the content of the survey the applicants will conduct key informant interviews (N= 120 to 150) with community agencies in 12 communities with a range of responses to CST. They also plan to engage the help of an Expert Advisory Group (EAG) including advocates, practitioners, survivors, and law enforcement investigators to provide feedback on the design and survey revisions. The applicants will pilot test the mail survey methodology with a sub-sample of LEAs (N=100) to identify and provide solutions to any barriers encountered in identifying CST cases in their data systems. Instruments and study findings will be informed by contextual, qualitative input from key informants who work with CST victims in communities with a range of approaches to CST. Then, the applicants will conduct follow-up interviews with law enforcement on approximately 1,000 identified cases of CST. The goal of these follow-up interviews is to collect detailed case data from key investigators about CSTs reported in the mail survey. The study is designed to identify new developments in police response since the applicants' first study.

2020-VT-BX-0111: Understanding the Physical and Psychological Health and Wellness Needs of Minor

**Sex Trafficking Victims** 

Amount: \$985,786
PI: Amy Farrell
Status: Open

Trafficking survivors are at risk for experiencing many health-related problems. However, little is known about the specific health consequences of sex trafficking of minors, as the field is primarily informed by research on adults and with non-U.S. samples, limiting the generalizability to U.S. youth. The proposed study will utilize a multi-method approach to advance research knowledge on health outcomes for minor sex trafficking survivors and improve our understanding of factors that facilitate and impede health care access. Specifically, the research team will work with seven established minor sex trafficking-serving community-based service provider organizations from across the United States to recruit a large sample of commercially sexually exploited youth (N=500) to participate in an anonymous health survey. The youth surveys will be supplemented with 20 in-depth interviews with adult survivors of minor sex trafficking who are in an appropriate place in their recovery to provide information and context about the physical and psychological health consequences of sex trafficking victimization and the barriers or facilitators of health care services and access. The proposed study is the first of its kind to utilize a robust sampling mechanism to capture the experiences of a large sample of minor sex trafficking survivors in the United States to enhance our understanding of the short- and long-term health consequences of sex trafficking.

For an index of all grants, go to <u>ojp.gov/sites/g/files/xyckuh241/files/archives/ncjrs/223572-grants-index.pdf</u>.